



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	Advances in Research
Manuscript Number:	2014_AIR_11625
Title of the Manuscript:	Heat transfer and solidification of molten iron in a pipe
Type of the Article	Research

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
<p>1) Page 5, part 3, "...3D transient simulations are carried out using a 56 000 element mesh,...". Why this amount of meshes has been chosen? The details of "mesh-independence analysis" should be added to the manuscript. It means that at least 1-2 graph or figure should be added to the present manuscript to show the mesh-independence analysis.</p> <p>2) At least 1-2 "Numerical Procedure Validation" should be added to the manuscript. It means this work should be compared with other works now, not in the future!</p>	<p>A section named "Mesh-independence analysis" was added to the manuscript. Here we deeply explain why the 56 000 element mesh was selected.</p> <p>A section named "Numerical procedure validation" was added to the manuscript. We think that not necessarily a numerical simulation must be compared with experimental or published results in order to be valid.</p>