



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Agricultural Extension, Economics & Sociology
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJAEES_13231
Title of the Manuscript:	FOREIGN LAND DEALS IN AFRICA: IMPLICATIONS FOR AGRICULTURAL TRADE
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Language correction is necessary L21, Expand LSFLDs in abstract similarly LSFLA (what in Line 144, 147, 368 etc?) L36 Provide Reference L38-39 Provide reference for "From available data, there have been incidences of largescale acquisition of land across Africa countries" L44-51 no valid reference? L57 it should be Moodie, 2011 L58-61 your own interpretation? From where did you find this informations? L58-67 is same as the M.S.Thesis by Damian C.U in "Water Use and Susu.., in South Africa"	Majority of the comments are very useful for our paper. We have modified and corrected as suggested herein.



SDI Review Form 1.6

	L85-86 Confusing weather alien countries investing for agriculture or industrial growth? Give solid reference. L90 delete (it is more than that in most African countries) L94-96 confusing because in L85-86. Be specific... L104-405 provide reference L107 which Table (land deals in Table) L128-129 re-word "The growing populationamong others can be blamed for this." L133-137 please re-write this sentences Figure 1 legend should be below the figure and figure quality is very, very poor because it is just cut and paste. I advise remaking this figure with the original data obtained from the Oxfam International. Also expand the data until 2014. L137 completes a paragraph but L142 The consequences.., is confusing? Is there any missing sentences? L149 expand Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) and then in L153 just SSA is enough	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Figure 2 Legend should be below the figure (words in figure squeeze so re-make) L158 is there any sentence missing? L158 Anseeuwet <i>al</i> (give year) L167-169 same meaning of earlier pages so delete these paragraph L170 start with This issue (which issue?) L170-174 repeating with same meaning earlier, delete.., L176 delete The land deals reported in this Table involves.., should be appropriate L209 Land Portal (YEAR)? L215 expand GDP L223 please calculate the value up to 2014 not only “1998 and 2008” L226-227if it is 50% reduction in 2008 means more reduction anticipated in last 6 years (e.g., 2008 to 2014)., Get the values and improvise the MS.,	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Why only up to 2008? Why not 2013 or 2014? Figure Legend 3 should go below and increase the trend line upto 2014 using the current data system. L250-252 Correct .., The information in the graph about the plot of arable land/hectare/persons indicate that the value has continuously declined over the period 1995-2008, except in 1996, 2003 and 2005. Another issue is that the value is less than 0.5 arable land/hectare/persons. Figure 4 legend issue., L272 Kaufmann et al (YEAR?) L287 From the Table (?) I know it is Table 4 so be specific like From the Table 4, SSA..., L288 it should be -0.71 to -0.77 L289 it should be -0.77 to -0.93 L295 tonot to L302 The Shonga case in Nigeria is an evident to this. Complete this word with proper discussion and I think Cotulla 2011 is reference for this so remove the period before., L316 observed from the Table 5?	
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	L322 to 337 should be corrected, clubbed and cut short as it discuss the same issue., L344 as reported in Table 2.1.? I couldn't get this lines?! L353 why Thegeneralised method of moments (GMM) estimator was used? Explain before introducing GMM L355 what does it mean (Acemoglu and Johnson; Meon and Sekkat; Osabuohien) Reference then YEAR? (Acemogluet al.,)? What happen to Table 6? and Table 7? Table 8 topic is insufficient, please write appropriate table title., L364 Large Scale Foreign Land Acquisitions (I expected this in the abstract itself) L368 LSFLAs is enough L372-375 please expand formula 1 and 2 with meaning for the Y, αit etc., by explaining in..., Where; $Y=?$, $\alpha it=crg=$, $prp=$, $gvn=$, $agInd=$, $crg_agInd=$, $prp_agInd=$, $gvn_agInd=$ etc., L387-388 paragraph is not uniform (font size etc) L395 where did you classify sub-section? Be specific about these lines "Thus, the results are presented in the Appendix while the major issues and implications are briefly summarised herein."	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	L398 The results in Table A1.1 in the appendix were obtained... L401 in table A2.1 in the appendix is proper way., L403 G, H and I in table A3.1 in the appendix shows... L418 Likewise, L423 The implication of the above is that (confusing) L434 explain (of va and rl) L435 expand LSFLD (.....agricultural land) L436 abbreviation is needed forrq and geand other formula criteria used., L449 large scale foreign land deals (LSFLA) was expected in abstract itself References wasn't formatted based on the journal guidelines. I suggest following uniformity in citing the references., I couldn't find citing the following articles in the running text?! 1. Li, T. M.. Centering labor in the land grab debate. Journal of Peasant Studies (March 2011), 281-298. 2. Adewole, M.A and Osabuohien, E.S.C (2007). "Analysis of Cost of Governance and Its Reduction Options in Nigeria"Nigerian Journal of Economic and Social Studies, Vol.49, No.1, pp.137-159. 3. Boussard, J.M., Daviron, B., Gerard, F., Voiturez, T. (2005) "Food Security	
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	And Agricultural Development in Sub-Saharan Africa: Building A Case for More Support". Rome: Food And Agriculture Organisation. 4. Cavalcanti, T.V, Magalhaes, A.M and Tavares, J.A (2008) "Institutions and Economic Development in Brazil", The Quarterly Journal of Economics and Finance, Vol.48, pp.412-432. 5. FAO-IFAD-UNCTAD (2010) The World Bank Group "Principles for Responsible Agricultural Investment that Respects Rights, Livelihoods and Resources", Extended Version. FIAN International <i>Annual Report 2010</i>, May<http://www.fian.org/resources/documents/categoria-1/fian-international-annual-report-2010/pdf>.(2011) 6. Freedom House (2011) <i>Freedom in the World</i> <http://www.freedomhouse.org/template.cfm?page=249>. 7. Greif, A. (2006) "Institutions and the Path to the Modern Economy: Lessons from Medieval Trade", Cambridge:University Press. 8. International Food <i>Policy</i> Research Institute (2009) -<i>IFPRI</i> IFPRI Policy Brief, No. 13. 9. Mark W. Rosegrant, M. S..2020 " Global Food Outlook: Trends, Alternatives, and Choices". Washington,D.C.:International Food Policy Research Institute. (2001) 10. Natal, A. "The New Institutional Economics: A General Introduction",	
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<i>Decocumento De DisssusionSobre El NeuvoInstitucionalismo</i>, (2001) No.1, pp.4-21. 11. North, D. C. "Institutions", <i>The Journal of Economic Perspectives</i>, (1991) Vol. 5, No. 1. pp. 97-112. 12. Osabuohien, E.S (2011) "Analysis of International Trade Performance in Selected SSA Countries: The Impact of Institutional Framework", <i>Unpublished Ph.D Thesis Submitted to Department of Economics andDevelopment Studies, Covenant University, Ota</i>. 13. Osabuohien, E.S and Ike, D.N (2011) "Economic Transformation and Institutional Framework in Nigeria-Lessons from Botswana and South Korea", Paper Presented at 52nd Annual Conference of Nigerian Economic Society on Planning and the Transformation of the Nigerian Economy, Covenant University, Ota, Nigeria,13-15th September. 14. Temple, J (1999) "The New Growth Evidence," <i>Journal of Economic Literature</i>, Vol.37, pp.112-156. 15. Williamson, O.E. (2000) "The New Institutional Economics: Taking Stock, Looking Ahead", <i>Journal of Economic Literature</i>, Vol. 38, No. 3. pp. 595-613. 16. World Bank (2011) "Africa Development Indicators", Washington DC: The World Bank. 17. Ding, Chengri (2005), Policy and praxis of land acquisition in China. Land	
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Use Policy 24, 1-13. 18. Zoomers, Annelies (2010), Globalization and the Foreignisation of Space: Seven Processes Driving the Current Land Grab. Journal of Peasant Studies, 37:2, pp 429-447 The following references is not in alphabetical order? 1. Braun, Joachim von and Meinzen-Dick, Ruth (2011); "Land Grabbing" by Foreign Investors in Developing Countries: Risks and Opportunities. International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) Policy Brief 13. 2. Ding, Chengri (2005), Policy and praxis of land acquisition in China. Land Use Policy 24, 1-13. 3. Nidhi Tandon (2010), New Agribusiness Investments Mean Wholesale Sell-out for Women Farmers. <i>Gender & Development</i> Vol. 18, No. 3, November 2010. The following is not a valid reference (gray literature) 1. Cotula, L, "Land Deals in Africa: What Is in the Contracts?" London (UK): International Institute for Environment (IIED), (2011), Retrieved from http://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=CRX7vyKJpa4C&oi=fnd&pg=PA1&dq=Land+deals+in+Africa:+What+is+in+the+contracts?&ots=BMgsWTUQ4e&sig=NboILLTQdY1BDGyhICU	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	01lxwww 2. FAO-IFAD-UNCTAD (2010) The World Bank Group “Principles for Responsible Agricultural Investment that Respects Rights, Livelihoods and Resources”, Extended Version. FIAN International <i>Annual Report 2010</i>, May<http://www.fian.org/resources/documents/categoria-1/fian-international-annual-report-2010/pdf>.(2011) 3. Freedom House (2011) <i>Freedom in the World</i> <http://www.freedomhouse.org/template.cfm?page=249>. 4. Greif, A. (2006) “Institutions and the Path to the Modern Economy: Lessons from Medieval Trade”, Cambridge:University Press. 5. International Food <i>Policy</i> Research Institute (2009) -<i>IFPRI</i> IFPRI Policy Brief, No. 13. 6. Osabuohien, E.S and Ike, D.N (2011) “Economic Transformation and Institutional Framework in Nigeria-Lessons from Botswana and South Korea”, Paper Presented at 52nd Annual Conference of Nigerian Economic Society on Planning and the Transformation of the Nigerian Economy, Covenant University, Ota, Nigeria,13-15th September. 7. World Bank (2011) “Africa Development Indicators”, Washington DC: The World Bank. Appendix Tables are not clear and do not have very good	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	explanations? Re-work on each tables and present with foot note explanations., Overall, the valuable study but written in hurry manner. Most of the literature cited is in grey literature and not peer reviewed ones. Quality of figure and table needed to be re-work. I suggest major revision on literature cited and the way it should be cited in running text. Some of them not at all cited but found in references list and some of the cited references are missing in the list. Overall authors can able to come in to some conclusion but I suggest major revision before it gets accepted. Especially authors should get data up to 2013 or 2014 and re-calculate and present with updated trend rather than showing the data only up to 2008. Language needed a minor work because in some part I couldn't understand what author wanted to say to audience. Good Luck with revision and re-submission.	
ethical issues in this manuscript	In Some Part grey Literature found	
<u>Optional/General</u> <u>I</u> comments	If any Plagiarism issue, please clarify us.	