



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                            |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Asian Journal of Agricultural Extension, Economics &amp; Sociology</a>                         |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_AJAEES_18834                                                                                            |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Post-liberalization import demand for rice in Ghana: trends, determinants and relevant policy implications |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                                  |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The author trying to look number of cases in one coin which complicate the paper to understand : I could have suggest to revised the title to be <b><i>“Estimating cost of trade liberalization on Ghana rice producers &amp; its policy implication”</i></b></li> <li><b>Introduction:</b> I have found the introduction very long and not much relevant to the case, with suggested topic the author should provide first the structure of agriculture economy in Ghana followed by previous study on trade liberalization in Ghana. Also as section you may provide industry background</li> <li><b>Methodological application:</b> with the trend analysis the authors are failing to understand the dynamic of agriculture, simply dividing the data into two pre &amp; post liberalization and estimating growth does not make sense, due to (i) agriculture growth in Africa is influenced mainly due to inefficiency on the production system, that is pre-post-harvest losses, inappropriate seed &amp; fertilizer application, lack of support service, economy of scale, food aid &amp; etc (ii) also it is very important to remember, from</li> </ul> | <p>In as much as we appreciate the reviewer's comments, we tend to disagree with most of the comments and refute majority of the suggestions. The focus of this study is more on assessing the determinants of import demand for rice in Ghana (after trade liberalization) and not on estimating the cost of import and trade liberalization on production. Most of the suggestions the reviewer is making are more channelled towards informing production decisions, which is not the primary focus of this study. Suggestions in line with methodology are however well noted and attended to. In addition, the revised paper now focuses on the determinants of rice import in Ghana (taking into consideration the impact of trade liberalization as well)</p> |



SDI Review Form 1.6

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|  | <p>trade liberalization “yes” primary sectors (such agric ) was negatively affected but the secondary industry was benefited a lot for example mining and beef industry in Southern Africa. Also it is very important to take into account the effect economic structural adjustment, that is from central economy (socialism ideology) to decentralized economy (free economy) while all African industries was infant (please read “Why Africa is poor”? by Greg Mills). On the other hand it is also imporntant from the point of consumer welfare benefit of trade liberalization provides more food access, affordability and more choices to consumers, which means from the consumer well-fare it is beneficiary.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Remember</b> also drivers of high food prices from the demand side (that may include <b>strong growth in Demand based</b> , Increased population, Rapid economic growth, Rising per capita meat consumption &amp; Rising farm production costs ) and Supply factors Slowing growth in agricultural production, high oil price, policies and cliamte change</li> <li>• I believe the first methodolgiaal applciation is not relevant, yes we know trade liberlization is one of the responsible facotor for lack of agric growth in africa, but it is not the only factors, there are a lof of factors. I suggest to drop Trend analysis rather stick to the second method with major revision.</li> <li>• The second methodological framework is appropriate; but should show the test with and without trend. Elasticity is interpreted inappropriate, the authors need to understand the agriculture sector by its nature is inelastic due to fact of</li> </ul> |  |
|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|-----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|                                         | <p>two reasons (i) longer lag of the supply response, based on current season occurrences farmers make decision for future production systems (ii) agriculture commodity represent very important food basket on consumers side this would resulted to inelastic nature. Therefore, upon interpreting the result the magnitude and direction of change need to be interpret accordingly.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>The model selection is not justified by empirical evidence, it is very important to show who has applied the method before and what was key finding and what do what do we expect from this study being different from the other side, I believe this is the only study applied ERROR CORRECTION MODEL</b></li> <li>• The policy implication is completely missing, need to be considered.</li> </ul> |  |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |