



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_3181
Title of the Manuscript:	Susceptibility of some dry date cultivars to infestation by <i>Oryzaephilus surinamensis</i> L.

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)

With all my respect to authors effort they made I cannot recommend the MS to be accepted. My decision is not saying anything about the quality of the presented research but about the English grammar and style. Still, the language is not grammatically correct; sentences are not clear and understandable. I am attaching examples of grammatical and style errors below (+ my other comments). I thing that from the examples is clear that the thorough revision of MS is needed. I would strongly recommend to authors to ask an English native person to check the MS before any other submission or to use a service provided by professional language editors.

Abstract

Grammar

Place in the text	Written erroneously	It should be written
Line 7	Saudia arabia	Saudi Arabia or more officially the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia
Line 9-10	Susceptibility of...were estimated	Susceptibility of...was estimated or Susceptibilities of...were estimated
Line 11, 24	Characters	characteristics
Line 12-13	(total soluble solid, sugar, moisture, nitrogen, lipids, and fatty acid and ash percentages)	(total amount of soluble solid, sugar, moisture, nitrogen, lipids, and fatty acids and percentage of ash)
Line 13	...of tested...	...of the tested...
Line 14	...attack of the saw- teethed grain beetle adults...	...attack by adults of the saw-teethed grain beetle
Line 15	The growth index of immature stages was increase in the most susceptible cultivars (Sukari) but decrease in the resistance one (Deglet Noor and Ajwa).	The growth index of immature stages increased in the most susceptible cultivars (Sukari) but decreased in the putative resistant ones (Deglet Noor and Ajwa).
Line 16, 19, 20	susceptible index	Probably it should be susceptibility index. In the original meaning is not clear to what the index is susceptible.
Line 19	There was...	We found...
	...the highest rate of tested date cultivars weight loss	...we recorded the following decreasing order among the

Authors' response to final evaluator's comments



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

	which caused by infestation of saw- toothed grain beetle was Barhi follow by Barni Al Madina, Rushodia and Sukari.	tested date cultivars in the rate of weight loss of fruit mass resulting from the infestation by the saw-teethed grain beetle: Barhi> Barni Al Madina>Rushodia> Sukari.
Line 23	Saw teethe beetle	Saw -teethe beetle
Line 23	...Date cultivars, Susceptibility,...	...date cultivars, susceptibility,...

Abstract

- Line 14 (Abstract) - explain what do you mean by "attack" of dates by adults of the saw-teethed beetle. If the attacking beetles are making other damage such as eating or polluting fruits, these facts need to be explained for readers.
- Missing is one or two sentences about the used methods of the date susceptibility evaluation.
- Line 15: The growth index of immature stages was increase in the most susceptible cultivars (Sukari) but decrease in the resistance one (Deglet Noor and Ajwa). See for the suggested grammar corrections above.

However, it is not explained what means the increase or decrease of the growth index or what the growth index is.
- Line 17: The susceptibility index. Missing in the Abstract is definition of the susceptibility index and explanation how it differ from the growth index.
- There is a confusion in the text caused by mixing cultivars that were regarded a priori as susceptible or resistant to the beetle infestation with the ones that were found susceptible or resistant by authors. I suggest that the second sentence of the Abstract provides information which of the mentioned date cultivars are regarded as susceptible and which one as resistant. Better explain and simplify the unclear sentence "On the other hand the susceptible index indicated that there are three cultivars like as Sukari, Barhi and Rushodia



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

considered the susceptible cultivars comparable with the other tested one".

Introduction
Grammar

Place	Written	suggestion
2nd sentence	...was yielded...	...yields...
2nd sentence	for use in agricultural production and for domestic utensils of human	...for the use as working tools in agricultural production and for the production of domestic utensils.
3rd sentence	..Africa, favored by the most suitable dry sub-tropical and high temperature climate prevailing in these regions.	...in Africa, where it is favored by the suitable dry sub-tropical and high temperature climate.
4th sentence	Herbest	Misspelled name
	Jacquelin du val	Misspelled name
	Hubner	Misspelled name

1. The world date palm cultivation is concentrated mostly in the Near East and Africa, favored by the most suitable dry sub-tropical and high temperature climate prevailing in these regions. - You should specify in which part of Africa the palm cultivation is taking place. Africa is a big continent and it is not clear if you mean for example Ivory Coast, Nigeria. Is there a difference between subtropical and high temperature climate? Remove one of the terms if they are repetitions or explain the difference.
2. The dates are the importance (?important) product of date palm which are used directly as fresh or dry at different countries especially, Arabic people. Why especially Arabic people? Are not dates utilized also by Berbers, Iranians, Pakistanis, Copts, Kurds, Turks, Ethiopians and many others? Better if you bring real data (for example, data provided by FAO) about dates production and



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

consumption then making a pleasant speculations. For example, you might find out that Iran is producing more dates than Saudi Arabia. 3. During storage, the dry dates are attacked by numerous pests which caused lost its' quality and quantity... Not clear to what its' is referring. Rewrite!	
---	--

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Tomas Pavlicek
Department, University & Country	Institute of Evolution, University of Haifa, Israel