



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012/AJEA/2282
Title of the Manuscript:	ASSESSMENT OF GENOTYPE X ENVIRONMENT INTERACTION AND STABILITY OF PROMISING SUGARCANE GENOTYPES FOR DIFFERENT AGRONOMIC CHARACTERS IN PESHAWAR VALLEY.

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

- This form has total 9 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	<p>Replace "G" with "g" on line 29; Insert "," after "However" (line 40) and "Hence" (line 42); Insert "more" before "stable" on line 43; Replace "grown" with "conducted" and "2" with "two" on line 51; Insert "of" before "16" on line 53; Replace "table 1" with "Table 1" on line 63 (and others of similar nature); Insert "," before and after "however" on line 66;<u>OR</u> Replace "however showing a non significant effect" with "except"; Replace "N" with "n" on line 67; Replace "-" with "x" on line 86; Replace "the characters except" with "all characters except for" on line 96; Replace "Singh and Singh, 1987, " with "Singh and Singh (1987)," on line 98;</p> <p>The following citations are not listed under Reference: Nissen, 1983. Is it "Nisson, 1983"? Willy et al. 2008"; Eberhart& Russell 1966. Is it "Ebberhart"?</p> <p>The following references are cited: Annicchiarico, P. 1957. Is it "Annicchiarico, 1997"? Anonymous. 2006-2007. Is it "Agriculture Statistics of 23 Pakistan, 2006-07"?</p>	<p>The corrections made as suggested.</p> <p>It is Eberhart& Russell 1966.</p> <p>"Annicchiarico, 1997" was omitted as it was not referred to in materials and methods. It is actually MINFAL who publishes the statistics, so is changed too.</p>



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Suwarno et al 2008.	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	<p>A general description of the 16 lines/varieties is needed in the M&M section; There are two environments only (SCRI and HSMF) with two crop seasons (2005-6 and 2006-7), unless those at SCRI were not belong to the same planting crop but two different planting at different locations within the SCRI; Insert a space wherever is needed; Use low case letter wherever appropriate; The abbreviations "CV" (line 63, Tables 1 and 3) and "b or b_j? value"(lines 107, 110, etc.) need to be defined in the text as well. Although b = 1.0 is fine, but when the authors say "close to 1", "less than 1", "more than 1", "greater than 1", it becomes much vague and is difficult to interpret. Perhaps some statistical text needs to be put in here (lines 107 through 135). This is important because it is the foundation for the conclusion. How to obtain and interpret the stability index (b or b_j) is critical for the paper.</p> <p>Suggestion: Have a traditional sugarcane breeder with quantitative genetics background to review the paper.</p>	<p>Description given in M&M.</p> <p>Actually there are three environments: 2 plant crops at SCRI (in two seasons) and one plant crop at SMFH.</p> <p>Spaces are inserted. Done. It is b value here (quoted from the reference) and bi values in the table.</p> <p>Reference of Finley and Wilkinson (1963) has been quoted for explanation of the values, and major changes have been made with reference to this paper.</p> <p>Any further suggestions would of course be welcomed.</p> <p>Thanks.</p>