



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_5191
Title of the Manuscript:	Influence of Water – washed Neem fruits (Azardirachta indica A. juss) on Haematology and Serum biochemical indices of West African Dwarf ewes

Ewes were used for the study because they were female and have started oestrus.

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The manuscript can be accepted for publication subject to the following few corrections. The authors did their best in effecting some of the corrections pointed out. However, the following should be corrected in the manuscript before publication. - No values for globulin in table 4 and you did mention under serum biochemistry determination (2.4) that globulin values were obtained by subtracting albumin from total protein. - Table 3: Basophils are component of total leucocyte count and this should be reflected in this table, even if you had zero values for all the groups. - Under serum biochemistry (2.4), line 6: aspartate transaminase, alanine transaminase. While the footnotes of table 4 read aspartate aminotransferase and alanine amino transferase. Use alanine aminotransferase throughout the document because alanine transaminase or aspartate transaminase are old nomenclatures. - Table 4: the unit of AST and ALT are not μ.i/l as stated in the table, but i.u/l or IU/l. Reference problems: Under discussion, the last line of the first paragraph: 'The MCHC values have been reported to be the most accurate and absolute values that indicate anaemic condition in animal [19 and 20]'. Reference 19 from reference section indicates that the reference cited is about statistical package and not about MCHC values as stated in the sentence above.	- Though, it was reported in the methodology, but, not reported in Table 4. However, the authors have decided to remove globulin from the methodology. This was necessary because of other issues that will arise with inclusion of globulin in the table. The issues include: virus infestation on the data base of the system used (PC) and no printed copy of the analysis - Basophils were determined but not seen on microscopic examination. i. e. = 0 - Corrected - Corrected - Reference 19 is not a statistical package rather it is a haematological textbook, while reference 20 talks about evaluation of toxicological effect of leaf meal. Reference 18 is SAS Software. Please verify this claim - Yes, the MCV and MCH values obtained in this study were above the normal range obtained in temperate region as reported by reference 7. However, the study was carried out in the tropics (Nigeria). Reference 7 is Clinical, Biochemical and Hematological reference values in normal experimental animals by Mitruka and Rawnsley (1977). - Corrected - Corrected - Corrected....Reference 30 is now reference 29 on the corrected version - Corrected....Reference 29 is now reference 28 on the corrected version



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

6. 'The MCV and MCH values observed in this study were above the normal range (28.4 – 31.6fL) and (9.20 – 9.80 pg) respectively reported for healthy ewe in temperate climate [7]. The higher mean cell volume (MCV) and the higher mean haemoglobin (MCH) values recorded in the present study when compared to [7] in the temperate climate could be attributed to climate and breed differences'.

From reference 7 cited above, the study was conducted in Ghana and to the best of my knowledge, Ghana is a tropical environment and not temperate as stated by the authors above. Therefore, the word temperate should all be changed to tropical.

7. Serum biochemical indices (3.2 Discussion)

'..... and all the values obtained for the 2 parameters were within the normal range reported [7] for a normal healthy ewe'. The serum cholesterol and triglyceride values obtained in this study were within the normal range reported for healthy ewe [7]. The serum Aspartate amino transferase (AST) and serum Alanine amino transferase (ALT) values observed in this study were above the normal range (40.0 - 123 μ .i/l) and (25.0 - 70 μ .i/l) respectively reported for healthy ewe [7]. The serum alkaline phosphatase (ALP) values were significant and were not within the normal range (μ .i/l) reported [7] for clinically healthy ewe'.

Sir, this study that was extensively cited by the authors on biochemical parameters in their study did not examine any biochemical component. The study examines blood cellular components; PCV, RBC counts, absolute and differential blood cell counts. This reference should be replaced with correct one. This study is available online at: <http://www.Irrd.org/Irrd193/baid19035.htm>.

8. 'The packed cell volume (PCV) and haemoglobin (Hb) were determined using microhaematocrit method and cyanmethaemoglobin method respectively [7]'.

Sir, this author did not invent these methods and neither were they described in their publication. Use of haematology textbook as reference will have been more appropriate.

9. Reference 30 under the reference section was not cited in the main text. This should be deleted.

10. Reference 29. The title,.....seed kernel to growing goats. This should read; seed kernel cake to growing goats.

The page number is wrong. The page number is; 1995(15): 105-111. Not



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

105-114 as stated in reference section.