



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_6615
Title of the Manuscript:	Sugarcane Genotype Performance in Three Environments (Based on Crop Cycle) at Mardan, Pakistan

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Experiment design and the discussion were revised as well! Authors still believe that different cropping systems including management can be considered as environment impact. This is a pity!	The general comments are acknowledged with thanks. The experimental design is the same as stated in materials and methods. For the part of the GXE on same location with different years/planting, the following reference is cited for your kind perusal. Singh and Chaudhary (1979) reported “ Sometimes the unilocation trials can also serve the purpose provided different environments are created by planting experimental material at different dates of sowing, using various spacings and doses of fertilizers and irrigation levels etc. The data thus obtained are subjected to environment-wise (location) analysis of variance followed by pooled analysis of data. In case of the variance due to genotype x environment interaction is found significant, one of the various approaches known for measuring stability of genotypes can be used and the varieties may be ranked accordingly” Reference: Singh, R.K., and B.D. Chaudhary. 1979. Biometrical methods in quantitative genetic analysis. Kalyani Publishers, N. Delhi, India. However, any further improvement would always be there and welcomed.