



## SDI Review Form 1.6

### **PART 1:**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                                                                                   |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2013_AJEA_3649                                                                                                                                 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>AN INVESTIGATION OF THE CONTENT OF MANGANESE IN THE FRUIT OF MARROWS IN RESPECT OF THE KIND OF FERTILIZER AND THE TYPE OF FERTILIZATION</b> |

**General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:**

**(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)**

- This form has total 7 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



## SDI Review Form 1.6

### **PART 2: Review Comments**

|                                            | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments | <p>I studied manuscript; the data presented is not enough for reviewing. The objective of this study is to determine the manganese content in the fruit of marrows in foliar fertilization with Fitona 0.3%, Hortigrow 0.3 %, Humustim 0.3 % and mixed fertilization (soil and foliar) and to determine the influence of manganese and fertilization upon the nutritious value of fruit of marrows. Author should focus the main objective i.e. the nutritious value of fruit of marrows which did not seem to be described properly in the whole manuscript. The English of the authors is very poor.</p> <p>An abstract is basically a short summary of a complete research. In present work it is not done well, there raised major queries i.e. what did actually author do to get? What are the larger implications of the findings? What is the empirical formula of BTC?</p> <p>In introduction Literature review not adequate. Old citations are used.</p> <p>In material and method experimental design is not described.</p> <p>Author used commercial products for the purpose of the experiment that are complete foliar fertilizers i.e. Fitona (7.2:0:5.2+M.E.), Hortigrow (20:20:20+M.E. +A.A) and Humustim (on base of potassium humates-3:1.14:7.83+M.E.), the values are given in brackets with some abbreviation is not understanding for the readers.</p> <p>It is obscure why the commercial products were selected for foliar spray?</p> <p>How much NPK and commercial products are applied to the soil/foliar spray?</p> <p>How did author prepare the water solution for foliar fertilizer?</p> <p>What will be its ECiw?</p> <p>Author should measure ECE of the soil.</p> |                                                                                                                                                                                      |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |
|-----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|                                         | <p>The author wrote ‘thirty days seedlings were grown in an unheated plastic greenhouse (what was the condition of plant at this moment it was not described?</p> <p>No data is presented for the growth. The authors should present the growth data of the plants.</p> <p>Which part of the plant material is used for the determination of manganese? And at what time it was collected?</p> <p>Statistical analysis is missing. Statistical significance was not shown in Tables.</p> <p>The discussion is not constructive and critical but simple descriptive, and the bibliography citations in the text are often reported without comment, even when providing contradictory results on the same kind of study.</p> <p>Conclusion is not written properly.</p> |  |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |

**Note: Anonymous Reviewer**