



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_3756
Title of the Manuscript:	Comparison of Different Parameters for Evaluation of Slow-blasting Resistance in Rice

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Some minor corrections were carried out in this revised version. However, major comments were not really taken into account. The proposed additional data analyses were not realized. The variation of resistance among years was not really investigated for each variety. Values of standard deviation were not provided for each variety in Table 1. Data are not exploited to assess the most discriminant parameters to evaluate resistance. So, in this revised version the data remain descriptive and the results are not carefully analysed. For example, the authors want to demonstrate that there are four groups. But there is no test to evaluate this hypothesis. And in fact the data show that there are probably only 3 groups. The repetitions of evaluation provided by the different cropping seasons are not exploited statistically to know if the ranking of varieties is robust. Etc. etc.	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Didier THARREAU
Department, University & Country	UMR BGPI, AGRO.M-CIRAD-INRA, Montpellier, France