

Genotype by Environment (G x E) Modeling of the Variable Initiation of Parthenocarpy *sensu stricto* in *Musa*: Elucidation of the Environmental Components of Variable Expressivity of Parthenocarpy in a Facultative apomictic *Musa acuminata* Subspecies Microcarpa Model System.

Shaibu, A.A.^{1*}, Okoro, P.^{2,3,4}, Ude, G.¹, Olukolu, B.A.¹, Ingelbrecht, I.¹, Tenkouano, A.^{2,3}, Ogburia, M. N.⁴ & Moonan, F.^{1,2} and Dimkpa, C.⁵

¹International Institute of Tropical Agriculture (IITA)

²IITA High Rainfall Station, Onne, Nigeria, IITA Headquarters Central Biotechnology Laboratory, Ibadan, Nigeria,

³IITA Humid Forest Ecoregional Center, Yaounde, Cameroon;

⁴Department of Crop, Soil Science and Forestry, Rivers State University of Science Technology, Port Harcourt, Nigeria

⁵Utah State University of Biological Engineering, 4105O old Main Hill Logan UT, 84322-4105 U.S.A.

ABSTRACT

To better understand the genome by environment (G x E) interactions that need to be accommodated in order to better predict hybrid performance for a high breeding value vegetative parthenocarpy trait *sensu stricto*. An analysis of the possible environmental signals contributing to the variability of a vegetative parthenocarpy trait *sensu stricto* via the genome x environment initiation of a genetic lesion that temporally, developmentally and systematically results in abortion of a parthenocarpic developmental regime was performed utilizing *Musa acuminata* accession Borneo as a model plant. We examined the effect of the variable and potentially modulating environmental signals, and performed a dissection of the genetic components of expressivity and penetrance in the vegetative parthenocarpy in Borneo, utilizing 180 apomictic progeny planted at different developmental ages in duplicate at each of two ecoregional zones. A total of 2,160 floral rachis from 720 mats of Borneo were measured for their subsequent expressivity and penetrance for vegetative parthenocarpy across individual flowers produced from a single vegetative mat, across local duplicate mats, and across ecoregional zones. The results of our study have produced a predictive G x E Model for expressivity of vegetative parthenocarpy in *Musa*, with validation of this model by a variety of statistical and probabilistic methods. Since expressivity of vegetative parthenocarpy to similar environmental signals have been identified across the monocot to dicot plants such as tomato, the generalized use of models such as presented in our

* Tel.: +234 803 674 4410

E-mail address: a.shaibu@hotmail.com

study may have broader applicability to a wider range of crop plants.

Keywords: Key Words: Expressivity, Genotype x Environment, Model, Parthenocarpy, Penetrance

1. INTRODUCTION

Penetrance genetically defines a percentage of individuals with a given genotype who exhibit the phenotype associated with that genotype, while expressivity is a measure of the extent to which a given genotype is expressed at the phenotypic level within an individual (GRIFFITHS *et al.* 2000). Across many crop species, and understanding of the variable expression of traits due to incomplete penetrance or variable expressivity, is an essential component for both traditional and nontraditional approaches to better fruit production. For example, a *DefH9-iaaM* auxin biosynthesis enzyme transgene has been shown to broadly confer parthenocarpy to tomato and other species (FICCADENTI *et al.* 1999; PANDOLFINI *et al.* 2002; ROTINO *et al.* 1997; ROTINO *et al.* 1996; SPENA *et al.* 1999; SPENA and ROTINO 2001; VAROQUAUX *et al.* 2000), however all *DefH9-iaaM* transgenic tomato plants analyzed to date lack commercial viability, primarily due to the production of a predominance of malformations that occur in their resultant fruit structure. These malformations resemble what is often referred to as the "Pickelhauben" phenotype, and resembles the types of abnormalities that can develop in the nontransgenic fruit that are treated with exogenous auxin (PANDOLFINI *et al.* 2002; SANTANGELO and SORESSI 1990; SPENA *et al.* 1999; SPENA and ROTINO 2001). In *DefH9-iaaM* transgenic tomato plants, expressivity of a "Pickelhauben" fruit phenotype may in part be affected by growth temperature fluctuations, suggesting that alterations of auxin effects in relation to cooler temperatures at flowering, and current transgenic approaches are focusing on the alteration of the promoter of a *DefH9-iaaM* transgene toward a down regulated range that can work within a range of expressivity of parthenocarpy versus "Pickelhauben" phenotype and G x E temperature dependence, to effect a balance in fruit production in terms of parthenocarpic seedless fruit and other preferred fruit qualities (PANDOLFINI *et al.* 2002; VARDY *et al.* 1989).

Although a variety of traits have economic impact in *Musa*, all edible cultivar banana and plantain fruit cultivar breeding requires an ability to produce progeny with two essential traits, to be considered: vegetative parthenocarpy and seedlessness (DODDS and SIMMONDS 1948; JENNY *et al.* 1993; KRISHNAMOORTHY and KUMAR 2004; ORTIZ 1995; ORTIZ *et al.* 1995; ORTIZ and VUYLSTEKE 1995; SWENNEN and VUYLSTEKE 1988; SWENNEN *et al.* 1991; VUYLSTEKE *et al.* 1997). A variable form of vegetative parthenocarpy *sensu stricto* has been described by Okoro *et al.* 2011, which appeared to be produced as a result of a genome x environment initiation of a genetic lesion that temporally, developmentally and systematically results in abortion of a parthenocarpic developmental regime. To better understand the genome by environment (G x E) interactions that might need to be accommodated in order to better predict *Musa* hybrid performance for a high breeding value vegetative parthenocarpy trait, an analysis was performed with a Borneo accession of *Musa acuminata* subspecies *Microcarpa* exhibiting this variably expressed form of vegetative parthenocarpy *sensu stricto* and the possible environmental signals contributing to the genome by environment (G x E) dependence exhibited by this trait, as identified by Okoro *et al.*, 2011. We examined the effect of the variable and potentially modulating environmental signals, and performed a dissection of the genetic components of expressivity and penetrance in this *sensu stricto* defined trait of vegetative parthenocarpy in Borneo, utilizing 180 apomictic progeny planted at different developmental ages in duplicate at each of two ecoregional zones. A total of

2,160 floral rachis from 720 mats of Borneo were measured for their subsequent expressivity and penetrance for vegetative parthenocarpy across individual flowers produced from a single vegetative mat, across local duplicate mats, and across ecoregional zones.

2. MATERIAL AND METHODS

2.1 Plant Materials and Ecoregional Field Sites

The experiments were performed with 180 *Musa* apomictic progenies vegetatively propagated as described by Vuylsteke et al., 1990a, and established in duplication in a randomized complete block experimental design across two locations in Nigeria as described by Okoro et al., 2011: a) an Onne site (Coastal High Rainfall Humid Forest ecoregional zone); and b) an Ibadan site (Inland Derived Savannah Forest Transition ecoregional zone). The plant genotypes grown were produced from apomictic seed and somatically propagated clones of a *Musa acuminata* subspecies *Microcarpa* accession Borneo described by Okoro et al., 2011. For clonal propagation, apomictic seed were produced by pollination barrier bagging, and 384 embryos and plants were recovered in high frequency by embryo culture methods, out of which 180 plants were selected for subsequent vegetative propagation of suckers in a shade house, and were designated as the TMB2x 28383 population of apomicts. A description of Borneo and developmental genetic characterization of the apparent genetic lesion producing the variably expressed form of vegetative parthenocarpy exhibited in Borneo, as it relates to other known forms of parthenocarpic expression in *Musa*, is further described. Somatic propagation of individuals of TMB2x 28383 apomictic population was performed by growing plants in the shade house, and random desuckering of suckers from mother plant mats, producing daughter sucker plants of different developmental ages. Each sucker planted in a 6 square meter planting area. When suckers of a clone failed to be transplanted, they were replaced with clones of same TMB2x 28383 designate that were maintained in reservoir in either field or shade house.

2.1.1 Data collection and analyses

From each mat, 3 successively rachis of flowers were analyzed, for a total of 2,160 rachis of flowers and bunches of fingers of fruit, produced from 720 clonal mats of *Musa* plants. To verify an expression of parthenocarpy, all flowers upon emergence were bagged with pollination barrier bags, to prevent pollination, such that only fruit development in the absence of fertilization would be scored. The phenotyping assay for the developmental genetic characterization of the variably expressed form of vegetative parthenocarpy exhibited by Borneo, is further described in Okoro et al., 2011. Measurement of penetrance was done by presence or absence of parthenocarpic expression of an individual after 3 flowering cycles. Measurement of expressivity was performed by the number of fingers in a bunch that persisted and developed as fruits. When non parthenocarpic expression occurred in ovaries, such ovaries typically dried out and dehisced from the rachis. Data analyses for determining G x E interactions involved in the variable expressivity of vegetative parthenocarpy (VPE) was performed with a variety of ANOVA models, with statistical computations and estimation for correlation and regression analysis pertinent to G x E interactions, carried out using the SAS Computer Package, utilizing both standard and stepwise regression procedures (HUSSEIN et al. 2000; SAS 1990). Trait variables were encoded and scored as follows: VPP= vegetative parthenocarpy % penetrance as the number of individual TMB 28383 population individuals which expressed at least two parthenocarpic fingers in one of their clonal mats distributed across locations. VPE= vegetative parthenocarpy expressivity in parthenocarpic hands/bunch; and DTRE= days to rachis and inflorescence emergence from a planting date of a TMB 28383 individual sucker.

127 For environmental variables, a (0) encoding designation indicates a measured variable on
128 the date of a rachis inflorescence's emergence from a pseudostem of a mat, and a (-10)
129 designation represents the same value measures at ten days prior to emergence.
130 **International Institute of Tropical Agriculture (IITA)**, maintained weather stations built and
131 maintained at the Ibadan and Onne sites, provided the specific daily environmental data that
132 was collected for data analyses. Environmental variables comprised daily measurements,
133 with the exception of DL= daylength, which constitutes a daylength average for the week of
134 rachis and flower emergence. Data variables were extracted from weather station data as
135 follows: Rnf= rainfall in millimeters; Evap= pan evaporation in millimeters; Mintemp=
136 minimum temperature in degrees Celsius; Maxtemp= maximum temperature in degrees
137 Celsius; Minrelh= minimum relative humidity measured in atmospheric % water saturation at
138 ground level; and Maxrelh= maximum relative humidity measured in % atmospheric water
139 saturation at ground level.

140 **2.1.1 Theory**

141

142 **2.1.1.1 G X E model data collection experimental design**

143

144 Tests of significance of components of two to multi-location trials were used for estimating
145 relative contribution of the various components to observed variation (HUSSEIN et al. 2000;
146 SAS 1990). The design of the experiment included the use of a daylength neutral plant,
147 which was accommodated by the Musa accession utilized. Randomization to provide
148 variation in flowering dates at different times of the year and under different environmental
149 requirements, with a sufficient sampling size are requirements of the G x E modeling, as well
150 as continuous collection of environmental data, by locally established commercially
151 purchased weather stations.

152

153 **2.1.1.1.1 The development of a G x E model for expressivity of vegetative** 154 **parthenocarpy *sensu stricto* in Musa**

155

156 Across all of TMB2x 28383 population plants at all sites, variation assessment was
157 performed for all measured environmental and trait data (Table 1). These results as shown
158 in Table 1 indicated that a wide range of environmental conditions were collected during
159 those daily periods and dates at which flower emergence, and are evidence of validation of
160 the precept in our experimental design, that the developmental age of the suckers planted as
161 well as the locations utilized, would provide substantive variation in flowering dates and
162 environmental conditions.

163

164 Utilizing procedures described in part by HUSSEIN *et al.* (2000) and SAS (2000), we analyzed
165 for trends in the variability of VPE as a dependent variable, with all available environmental
166 and phenotypic data variables as independent variables. Our analysis included the use of
167 both standard and stepwise regression procedures. From a regression analysis of all
168 variable data, all significantly identified output variables were specifically reanalyzed with a
169 "stepwise regression analysis" which functioned to eliminate the least significant variables
170 one at a time to lead to output of those variables which provide the greatest probability of
171 contribution within a specific model. In summary, the results of stepwise regression analysis
172 produced essentially the same outputs and probabilities for the Minrelh (-10), and Mintemp
173 (0) environmental variables, however an initial Minrelh (0) environmental variable was output
174 as a less significant variable, in relation to the VPE variable under the initial regression
175 analysis; but was output with greater significance and a greater probability, as an
176 independent variable contributor to a dependent VPE variable.

177

The results of the stepwise regression, whose outputs are shown in Table 2, indicate that two environmental variables (Minrelh and Mintemp) and one developmental phenotypic variable (DTRE) comprising temporal components could be identified with predictive significance. Results of stepwise regression also indicated that small incremental changes in the downward temperature trend of a Mintemp (0) variable correlated to greater increases in VPE (parameter estimate of -1.524), in comparison to increases in VPE correlated to increases in % relative humidity that were drawn to each of the Minrelh (-10) or Minrelh (0) variables (parameter estimates of 0.0758 and 0.0974 respectively). Further examination of the weather data indicated that the daily minimum temperature measurements always occurred at night, while the min relative humidity measurements had less temporal daily certainty, fluctuating perhaps by impact of weather patterns of rainfall (day or night) as well as relative humidity.

The output of this data from stepwise regression analysis, in its most logical interpretation, led to an initial design of a predictive model for an increased expressivity of vegetative parthenocarpy, based on precepts that the following variables contributed to an increased expressivity of vegetative parthenocarpy, if they exhibited the following characteristics: 1) a minimum temperature on the date of flowering trending toward a lower temperature range (i.e. Cooler nights); and 2) a determinative persistent relative humidity trend occurring for a period extending from 10 days prior to flowering until the flowering, exhibiting a higher minimum value (ie. The overall relative humidity is persistently higher). Because of the temporal relationship of the environmental variables themselves, specifically that of environmental variables Mintemp and Minrelh measured at the DTRE date (0), or ten days prior in relation (-10), the DTRE output in Table 2 can be assessed as simply a validation of the experimental design precept that signaling events occurring at (time 0) or around (time - 10) would most likely impact the variable expressivity of vegetative parthenocarpy (VPE).

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Variable expression of vegetative parthenocarpy in Borneo is due to variable expressivity rather than incomplete penetrance

All clonal reps of each of the TMB 28383 individuals, across both locations were analyzed for individual expression of at least one parthenocarpic fruit, to determine the penetrance of vegetative parthenocarpy, over the course of emergence of three successive floral rachis, from independent pseudostems of the same mat. As describe by Okoro *et al.*, 2011, Borneo is monocious and facultative apomictic, with the female flowers of its rachis are developmentally isolated from the male flowers; and as such is an outcrossing genotype. Furthermore, Borneo exhibits a form of variable expression of parthenocarpy *sensu stricto*, given its facultative apomictic biology. Figure 1. illustrates some of the typical results in parthenocarpic expression observed from assays of the TMB2x 28383 population and its clonal replicates. For example in different inflorescences produced from the same clonal mat at diff times of year in Ibadan, as shown for the TMB 28383-34 plant in Fig. 1 A and C, the expression of parthenocarpy *sensu stricto* can appear to be completely or incompletely penetrant. However, all clonal plants of individual apomicts of the population, when examined in summary, often exhibited an intermediate form parthenocarpic *sensu stricto* expression as shown in Fig. 1B. Results from the scoring of every clone of each original individual 180 apomictic members of TMB2x 28383 population, indicate that the expression of the penetrance of vegetative parthenocarpy (VPP) was 100% across all individual TMB 28383 individuals, because at least one clone of each of the TMB28383 population exhibited vegetative parthenocarpy. These results indicate that the variation of expression of vegetative parthenocarpy was not due to incomplete penetrance (VPP), because each individual could be scored as comprising the trait; but rather that the variation in

parthenocarpic expression was the result of the variable expressivity of vegetative parthenocarpy (VPE) (GRIFFITHS *et al.* 2000)

233

234 **3.1.1 Validation and predictiveness testing of a G x E model for the variable** 235 **expressivity of vegetative parthenocarpy in *Musa***

236

237 Additional analyses were performed to examine the predictiveness and validation of this
238 model. We analyzed performance and predictiveness of this model in relation to expression
239 at locations and to expression after successive rachis generation from a clonal mat. Since
240 the coastal and inland zone sites were well known to comprise different temperature and
241 humidity ranging zones, as well as radically different soil types, an analysis of variability was
242 performed across locations, to examine if the outputs across and within ecoregional zones
243 were consistent with the outputs of Table 2. The results of an analysis of variability across
244 locations, supported evidence to indicate a high reliability and predictiveness of the
245 developed G x E model for VPE. All of the environmental and trait variables examined
246 exhibited significant differences across both ecoregional zone locations (see Table 3).
247 Utilizing the G x E model of VPE, the VPE LSMeans measurements identified in Table 3,
248 include values that would be predicted by the model, and as such, a variety of variables
249 including the radically different soil types at the two locations, could be excluded as
250 significant variables in our G x E dependent modeling of VPE to a major extent.

251

252 For example, as shown in Table 3, the overall Least Square Means (LSMeans) of the
253 expressivity of the parthenocarpy was approximately 14 (i.e. 13.97016) fingers at the inland
254 Ibadan site, while the LSMeans expressivity was significantly different at appr. 3 (i.e.
255 2.999064) fingers at the coastal Onne site. The LSMeans of Mintemp (0) at the Ibadan site
256 was 21.5 (i.e. 21.5026) degrees Celsius (C) and the LSMeans of Mintemp (0) at the Onne
257 site was 22.6 (i.e. 22.63872) C, suggesting that an increase in expression to appr. 14
258 parthenocarpic fingers from appr. 3 fingers could be predicted in part by a moderating drop
259 in night time temperature of appr. 1.1 degree Celsius under certain conditions of relative
260 humidity, with such combined environmental signals more likely to occur at an inland
261 temperature fluctuating Ibadan location, than a temperature moderating coastal Onne
262 location. This small increment of 1.1 degrees was thus statistically significant and highly
263 predictive for VPE, consistent with the comparatively large negative Mintemp (0) parameter
264 value associated with the analysis of all samples, as indicated in Table 2. Furthermore, both
265 Minrelh (-10) and Minrelh (0) variables exhibited relatively low but positive parameter values
266 compared to Mintemp (0) with the total sample size, as shown in Table 2, with parameter
267 values of Minrelh (-10) exhibiting a lower correlated change to VPE compared to Minrelh (0)
268 (values of 0.758 compared to 0.0973). This suggested that a persistence in a lower value of
269 relative humidity, with a signal from this variable increasing in genetically determinative
270 impact of expressivity, as rachis emergence approached (over a 10 day period). These
271 results also indicated, that to perform more detailed model validation, analysis of Minrelh (0)
272 and Maxrelh (0) as well Minrelh (-10) and Maxrelh (-10) needed to be examined across
273 locations. As Shown in Table 3, the Minrelh (-10) and Minrelh (0) LSMeans were not
274 statistically significantly different from each other, within each of the two locations. The
275 Maxrelh (-10) and Maxrelh (0) LSMeans measurements for Ibadan were ~97% relative
276 humidity (i.e. 96.80869 and 96.83294 % respectively), and for Onne were ~93 % relative
277 humidity (i.e. 93.26445 and 93.46837 % respectively). The Maxrelh variables failed to
278 output as significant independent variables contributing to a trend of a dependent VPE,
279 although the Minrelh variable output as such (see Table 2). While these variables indicated
280 daily periods of very high water saturation of the air at ground level, reflective of the tropical
281 environs, these high values did not appear to be associated with rainy versus dry seasons,
282 since the rainfall variables themselves failed to exhibit any statistically significant correlative
283 trend with a dependent VPE variable (see the Rnf variable of Table 3). Furthermore, the

measurements at the Ibadan site were 56.53732 [S.E. 0.53839] and 56.69222 [S.E. 0.512954] % relative humidity, and at Onne site for 42.89453 [S.E. 0.606844] % and 44.07873 [0.579808] % relative humidity for Minrelh (-10) and Minrelh (0) LSMeans variables respectively. Thus, a G x E Model for VPE that a higher persistent relative humidity provided by a higher persistent minimum relative humidity value would produce a dependent increase in expressivity of parthenocarpy developed for all data was predictive within these different locations regardless of their differences in soil types and other ecologies, the expectation would be that under a Minrelh LSMeans of 43-44 % minimum relative humidity at Onne ten days prior and at rachis emergence, one would predict a lower VPE LSMeans value in relation to the same rachis emerging at the same developmental time periods, but under a 56.5-56.7 % relative humidity. Furthermore, for the 43-44% LSMeans of Minrelh at the Onne site, and the 56.5-56.7 % LSMeans of Minrelh at the Ibadan site, the VPE LSMeans is indeed relatively higher at the Ibadan versus Onne sites at a significant difference of 14 to 3 LSMeans parthenocarpic fingers respectively, providing evidence of validation of the proposed G x E model for VPE, across locations.

For further G x E Model validation testing, a closer examination of the DTRE variable was performed, to determine if the model derived from the total dataset was consistent in VPE prediction across the three successive flowers produced across a mat, regardless of flowering location. As shown in Table 4, the LSMeans number of days after planting of the mother plant that gave rise to each successive rachis and inflorescence from that mother plant derived mat were: 196.6357 days for the first rachis (rachis 1) from the mother; 236.6203 days for the second rachis (rachis 2) from the most apically dominant sucker of the mother mat; and 244.6372 days for the third rachis (rachis 3) of the second most apically dominant sucker from the mother mat. For rachis 1, rachis 2, and rachis 3 samplings, the LSMeans Mintemp (0) were 22.2036, 21.8528, and 21.93044 degrees Celsius, with comparisons of rachis combinations 1 to 2 and 1 to 3 exhibiting significant differences, but not rachis 2 to 3 combinations. The LSMeans measurements of the expressability of parthenocarpy in bunches on rachises 1, 2, and 3 were 5.872002, 9.147032, and 10.4348 fingers respectively, consistent with a trend toward a downward Mintemp (0) value correlating at high probability to an increased expressability of parthenocarpy, as entailed in our G x E model. Furthermore, although the LSMeans Minrelh (-10) measurements were insignificantly different at measurements of 50.336, 50.67061, and 50.14982 % relative humidity, as shown in Table 3, a between location LSMeans Minrelh (-10) value range of 56 % downward to 42 % relative humidity would be predicted by our G x E model to produce a trend of a decrease in expressivity of parthenocarpy from appr. 14 to 3 fingers respectively. The LSMeans calculated values of the variable expressivity of parthenocarpy consisted of values between 10 to 6 fingers, associated with an LSMeans Minrelh (-10) value of appr. 50 degrees Celsius, was thus consistent with a variable expressivity model in which a higher daily relative humidity before flower emergence and a minimum temperature at night during flower emergence contributes to an increased expressivity of parthenocarpy, providing further supporting evidence of prediction performance of the G x E Model for VPE.

3.1.1.1 In what context might this type of G x E model be used, and how broadly applicable is it?

The objective of this study was to better understand the environmental components comprising a set of the G x E interactions that need to be accommodated in order to better predict hybrid performance of vegetative parthenocarpy using *Musa* as a model plant. The stature of *Musa* spp. as a gigantic herbs, typically grown in a 6 square planting area over the course of up to a 3 year planting and multiple flowering evaluation cycle make it simply difficult to manage for growth chamber based experimental cycles (ORTIZ 1995; ORTIZ *et al.* 1995; VUYLSTEKE *et al.* 1997) that might otherwise be possible for in other fruit crops that might be utilized for genetic models of gene expression of parthenocarpy, such as tomato

(MAPELLI *et al.* 1978; MAZZUCATO *et al.* 1998; MAZZUCATO *et al.* 1999; PANDOLFINI *et al.* 2002; ROTINO *et al.* 1997; ROTINO *et al.* 1996; SPENA *et al.* 1999; SPENA and ROTINO 2001; VARDY *et al.* 1989; VAROQUAUX *et al.* 2000) The accession Borneo is a *Musa acuminata* subspecies *Microcarpa* classified plant, with a low degree of apical dominance and a high production of suckers from a mat, by comparison to many *Musa* germplasm utilized in cultivation and breeding. This relatively low apical dominance and high vegetative sucker production from an initial mother corm, inherently produces an acceleration of the flowering of such plants, within the first two years, that is often not observed in other *Musa* cultivars and accessions. This temporal developmental production of inflorescences from a single mat of Borneo, is in part represented in Table 4, which shows that across all zones and plantings that: the first inflorescence emerged with an LSMeans of appr. 237 days after planting; the second with an LSMeans 40 days after the first inflorescence; and the third with an LSMeans appr. 8 days after the second inflorescence. The reliability of the model presented in this study, thus might to some extent be less predictive in genotypes that exhibit greater apical dominance, and further study in this regard is suggested.

The results of this study reliably demonstrate that in the accession Borneo of *Musa acuminata* subspecies *Microcarpa*, plasticity in expression of a trait of vegetative parthenocarpy is not due to incomplete penetrance, but rather due to a G x E interactions resulting in variable expressivity. Our results also provide strong evidence to demonstrate that the most probable G x E model is one by which the environmental signals of a persistently higher daily relative humidity ten days before flower emergence, and a cooler night time minimum temperature at flower emergence function as environmental signals that produce a trend toward an increase in expressivity of vegetative parthenocarpy in Borneo. In terms of how broadly applicable this G x E model might be to other plants, or in general to a view of variable expressivity of a trait, is difficult to ascertain, but the methodology in developing such a model can be considered as extensible. In terms of parthenocarpic expression in plants in general, an effect on variable expressivity of parthenocarpy by external signals is not unique to *Musa*, and is typically found much less across the range of plants to dicots. However, in tomato, much as shown for *Musa* in this study, parthenocarpic fruit production in certain mutant PAT and wild type tomato cultivar genotypes occurs not by incomplete penetrance, but by variable expressivity in which increased expression of parthenocarpy is correlated to cooler temperatures of the plants at flowering (MAZZUCATO *et al.* 1999; VARDY *et al.* 1989), and this methodology should be extensible at minimum to a crop such as tomato. Given the concurrence of cooler temperatures at flowering as common signals for tomato and *Musa*, a general statement that a temperature-modulating signal for a variable expressivity of parthenocarpy occurs across both monocots and dicots is a reasonable interpretation.

3.1.1.1.1 What other traits might best be analyzed with G x E models of the type as presented in this study?

Besides parthenocarpy, a variety of other plant crop traits of high economic value, exhibit G x E dependence in plasticity of expression, that can heavily impact a breeding process, or result in negative or positive heterotic trait expression in developed cultivars or landraces that might be translocated into new ecoregional planting zones (BAIYERI *et al.* 2000; BEAVIS 1994; BIDINGER *et al.* 1996; GOLD *et al.* 2000; KANG 1995; KANG 1998; LIN *et al.* 1986). For example in *Musa*, other traits that affect yield stability, disease resistance, ovule and pollen fertility, as well as embryo and seed production, often appear to exhibit G x E dependent variable expressivity (BAIYERI *et al.* 2000; JENNY *et al.* 1993; ORTIZ 1997; ORTIZ *et al.* 1998; ORTIZ and VUYLSTEKE 1995; ORTIZ and VUYLSTEKE 1995; ORTIZ *et al.* 1995; SWENNEN and VUYLSTEKE 1988; SWENNEN *et al.* 1991) While often observed, this variable expression is often not identified as correlating to any specific set of environmental conditions. To date,

390 only observations of correlations between environmental conditions of relative humidity to
 391 alterations in pollen viability, or to the degree of expression of meiotic restitution
 392 mechanisms that result in pollen ploidy have been reported for *Musa* (ORTIZ *et al.* 1998).
 393
 394 Is there any other potential utility for a model of this type? To some extent, the ability to
 395 predict the temporal component of genetic determination of a trait that is the result of
 396 temporal concerted gene action, may have a very useful utility in gene discovery for some
 397 important genes expressed genetically downstream of environmental signals and their
 398 putative receptor components. For example, if the production of certain gene transcripts of
 399 Borneo at flowering are determinative, then to a certain extent, we can predict that the gene
 400 expression profile of plants with an increased determination for expressivity of parthenocarpy
 401 would have different gene expression profiles that could provide for gene discovery. With a
 402 model plant such as that of Borneo, if flowering occurs with a monitored 21 Celsius night
 403 time temperature and persistent relative humidity of 50%, then gene expression in flowers
 404 can be expected to have a high genetic determination of parthenocarpy, and a concurrent up
 405 or down regulation of transcription of genes accompanying such predicted genetic
 406 determination. Such an approach has been utilized extensively with a variety of chemical
 407 and other stress-induced paradigms, but rarely has been utilized with temporal
 408 developmental genetically determinative paradigms, because a means of measure of
 409 genetic determination are often not available. The methodology presented here, could thus
 410 easily be extended across a variety of crop species and traits, for example with
 411 parthenocarpy in tomato, once a predictive G x E model for expressivity is reliably validated.
 412
 413 Variable expressivity of parthenocarpy in the form of complete expression of parthenocarpy
 414 (Fig. 1C) and complete lack of expression of parthenocarpy (Fig. 1 A) are shown for different
 415 flowers of the same mat produced at different times of the year at an Ibadan site location, for
 416 plant 28383-26. Variable expressivity of parthenocarpy within the same rachis of a 28383-74
 plant at an Ibadan site location is shown in Fig. 1 B.



418 **Figure 1.** Rachises and inflorescences demonstrating typical types of results from a
 419 phenotypic external pollination barrier assay for the variable expressivity of
 420 vegetative parthenocarpy sensu stricto in *Musa acuminata* subspecies
 421

422 **Table 1:** Trait and Environmental Variable R-square, Mean, and Coefficient of Variation
 423 Values, with an Estimation of the Various Levels of Significance (Sig.) Across All Mats
 424 of the TMB 28383 Population, and Across Locations. Environmental and trait variable
 425 encodings are as described in Materials and Methods.
 426

Source of variation	R ²	Means	Coeff. Of Variation	Sig. Across TMB 28383	Sig. Across Location
---------------------	----------------	-------	---------------------	-----------------------	----------------------

Vegetative Parthenocarpy Expressivity (VPE)	0.234	7.372	256.57	0.0062	0.0001
Rnf (-10)	0.219	3.302	257.17	0.0013	0.0001
Evap (-10)	0.264	3.270	34.70	0.0001	0.0001
Mintemp (-10)	0.322	22.026	6.35	0.0001	0.0001
Maxtemp (-10)	0.435	31.300	6.05	0.0001	0.0001
Minrelh (-10)	0.384	49.681	28.22	0.0001	0.0001
Maxrelh1 (-10)	0.495	94.930	2.50	0.0001	0.0001
DL	0.680	11.925	1.66	0.0005	0.0001
Rnf (0)	0.199	3.100	262.97	0.0001	0.0001
Evap (0)	0.283	3.389	34.44	0.0007	0.0001
Mintemp (0)	0.360	22.103	6.12	0.0001	0.0001
Maxtemp (0)	0.345	31.097	7.52	0.0001	0.0001
Minrelh (0)	0.375	50.298	26.53	0.0001	0.0001
Maxrelh (0)	0.524	95.062	2.16	0.0001	0.0001
DTRE	0.615	222.150	22.75	0.0001	0.0001

428 **Table 2: Step-wise Regression Outputs of Significant Variable Trends of High**
 429 **Probability (Pr) for Predictability for a Trend of an Increased Expressivity of**
 430 **Vegetative Parthenocarpy.**
 431
 432

Variable	DF	Parameter Estimate	Standard Error	t-Value	Pr > t
Intercept	1	22.118	9.125	2.42	0.0155
Minrelh (-10)	1	0.0758	0.0368	2.06	0.0398
Mintemp (0)	1	-1.524	0.374	-4.08	<0.0001
Minrelh (0)	1	0.0973	0.0371	2.62	0.0089
Dfl	1	0.0496	0.010	4.94	<0.0001

433
 434
 435 The Vegetative Parthenocarpy Expressivity (VPE) Variable trend is utilized as the dependent
 436 variable trend. Parameter estimates and t-value calculations are indicative of upward or
 437 downward trends. The main fact in this study is that “a higher daily relative humidity before
 438 flower emergence and minimum temperature at night during flower emergence contributes to
 439 an increased expressivity of parthenocarpy” in the species in the investigation. As earlier
 440 mentioned, parthenocarpy obtained via traditional genetics often shows a variable
 441 expressivity of the trait (e.g. some tomato parthenocarpic mutants). Temperature is certainly
 442 one of the major environmental factors affecting the expressivity of parthenocarpy.
 443

444 **Table 3. The Standard error (S.E.) Associated with the Least Square Means (LSMeans)**
 445 **for each of the Inland (Ibadan) and Coastal (Onne) Ecoregional Site Locations for**
 446 **Environmental and Trait Variables.**
 447

Variables	Inland Ibadan Site		Coastal Onne Site	
	LSMeans	S.E.	LSMeans	S.E.
VPE	13.97016	0.861655	2.999064	0.905333
Rnf (-10)	5.789579	0.325913	1.246274	0.367556
Evap (-10)	3.017004	0.044167	3.539868	0.049386
Mintemp (-10)	21.58121	0.053692	22.41001	0.060553
Maxtemp (-10)	30.12703	0.072711	32.3804	0.082001
Minrelh (-10)	56.53732	0.53839	42.89453	0.606844
Maxrelh (-10)	96.80869	0.090958	93.26445	0.10258
DL	12.14356	0.007583	11.66348	0.008552
Rnf (0)	4.055292	0.312976	2.173531	0.354044
Evap (0)	2.95302	0.045646	3.819101	0.050938
Mintemp (0)	21.5026	0.051938	22.63872	0.058754

Maxtemp (0)	30.06936	0.0898	32.03955	0.101583
Minrelh (0)	56.69222	0.512954	44.07873	0.579808
Maxrelh (0)	96.83294	0.07875	93.46837	0.089084
DTRE	276.9113	1.941886	175.0175	2.187684

Population and replicate sizes were identical across locations, comprising 360 clonal plant mats at each site over 3 flowering cycles, for a total sample size of 1080 rachises of flowers analyzed at each location. Environmental and variable trait encoding is as described in Materials and Methods.

Table 4: The Least Square Means (LSMeans) and Standard Error (S.E.) of Environmental and Trait Variables for the First Three Successive Rachises that Emerged from Independent Pseudostems Produced from the Same Mat.

Variables	Levels of	Rachis 1		Rachis 2		Rachis 3	
		Probability	LSMeans	S.E.	LSMeans	S.E.	LSMeans
VPE	0.0016	5.872002	0.864934	9.147032	1.032758	10.4348	1.1538276
Rnf (-10)	0.0162	2.756736	0.368964	3.41835	0.404041	4.378694	0.44005821
Evap (-10)	0.749	3.308128	0.049873	3.255206	0.054408	3.271975	0.05937374
Mintemp (-10)	0.0001	22.2036	0.060785	21.8528	0.066563	21.93044	0.0724969
Maxtemp (-10)	0.0001	31.53144	0.082315	31.02413	0.090141	31.20557	0.0981763
Minrelh (-10)	0.187	48.92819	0.609131	50.53167	0.667444	49.68792	0.7264484
Maxrelh (-10)	0.0001	94.27248	0.102973	95.31432	0.112762	95.52291	0.1228143
DL	0.0001	11.99221	0.008585	11.88085	0.009401	11.83749	0.0102392
Rnf (0)	0.6093	2.909014	0.354763	3.004127	0.388718	3.430094	0.4239236
Evap (0)	0.0693	3.475836	0.051387	3.307043	0.056222	3.375301	0.061264
Mintemp (0)	0.0152	22.19852	0.058873	21.9548	0.064508	22.05866	0.0703501
Maxtemp (0)	0.1285	31.20801	0.10179	30.91296	0.111532	31.04239	0.1216335
Minrelh (0)	0.8414	50.336	0.580888	50.67061	0.637832	50.14982	0.6940993
Maxrelh (0)	0.0001	94.5198	0.089265	95.42102	0.097808	95.51114	0.1066667
DTRE	0.0001	196.6357	2.196041	236.6203	2.404706	244.6372	2.62234

Data presented was derived from data from all duplicates and mats at both planting locations of Ibadan and Onne.

4. CONCLUSION

The results of our study include the development of a predictive $g \times e$ model for the expressivity of vegetative parthenocarpy in *musa*, and validation of this model by a variety of statistical and probabilistic methodological methods. the results of this study also indicate, that while the apparent penetrance of vegetative parthenocarpic expression produced from a mat, or within any one individual plant provided an appearance of incomplete penetrance of parthenocarpy, that by increasing sample sizes and to duplicates across ecoregional zones demonstrated that the penetrance of vegetative parthenocarpy at the level of clonal individuals was in actuality complete, and that the variability in the trait expression observed was not the result of incomplete penetrance phenomenon, but rather the result of this variable expressivity phenomenon which could be modeled and reliably predicted, by the use $G \times E$ modeled trends that exhibited statistical and probabilistic dependence upon trends of specific environmental variables. The study suggests that the reported findings might assist the discovery of novel parthenocarpic genes. Clearly transcript profiling has been used to identify novel parthenocarpic genes, and perhaps the information provided in this study might be helpful, but however, other approach have been used in other species.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors wish to thank IITA for providing research environment and the tools for carrying out this study.

COMPETING INTERESTS

"Authors have declared that no competing interests exist."

AUTHORS' CONTRIBUTIONS

Shaibu, A.A, designed the study, performed the statistical analysis, wrote the protocol, and wrote the first draft of the manuscript. Author Okoro, P., Ude, G., Olukolu, B. A., Ingelbrecht, I., Tenkouano, A., Ogburia, M.N., Moonan, F., and Dimkpa, C., manage the literature searches, read through and approved the final manuscript.

REFERENCES

- BAIYERI, K. P., A. TENKOUANO, B. N. MBAH and J. S. C. MBAGWU (2000). Ploidy and genomic group effects on yield components interaction in bananas and plantains across four environments in Nigeria. *Scientia Horticulturae*, 85, 51-62.
- BEAVIS, W. D., 1994 The power and deceit of QTL experiments: lessons from comparative QTL studies, in *Proc. 4th Annual Corn and Sorghum Industry Research Conference*, edited by ASTA. ASTA, Washington D.C. pp. 250-266.

508 BIDINGER, F. R., G. L. HAMMER and R. C. MUCHOW (1996). The physiological basis of
509 genotype by environment interaction in crop adaptation, in *Plant adaptation and crop*
510 *improvement*, edited by M. COOPER and G. L. HAMMER. CAB International, London.
511 pp. 329-347.

512 DODDS, K. S., and N. W. SIMMONDS (1948). Sterility and parthenocarpy in hybrids of *Musa*.
513 *Heredity* 2, 101-117.

514 FICCADENTI, N., S. SESTILI, T. PANDOLFINI, C. CIRULLO, G. L. ROTINO *et al.*, (1999). Genetic
515 engineering of parthenocarpic fruit development in tomato. *Molecular Breeding* 5,
516 463-470.

517 GOLD, C. S., E. B. KARAMURA, A. KIGGUNDU, A. M. K. ABERA, F. BAGAMBA *et al.*, (2000).
518 Geographic shifts in highland banana production in Uganda. *Acta Horticulturae* 540,
519 55-62.

520 GRIFFITHS, A. J. F., J. H. MILLER, D. T. SUZUKI, R. C. LEWONTIN and W. M. GELBART (2000). *An*
521 *introduction to Genetic analysis, 7th edition*. W. H. Freeman and Co., New York.

522 HUSSEIN, M. A., A. BJORNSTAD and A. H. AASTVEIT (2000). Sasg x estab, a SAS program for
523 computing genotype x environment stability statistics. *Agronomy J.* 92, 454-459.

524 JENNY, C., E. AUBOIRON, D. VUYLSTEKE and R. ORTIZ (1993). Influence of genotype and
525 environment on seed set in plantain. *MusAfrica* 3, 3.

526 KANG, M. S. (1995). *New perspectives on genotype by environment interactions*. CRC Press,
527 New York.

528 KANG, M. S. (1998) Using genotype by environment interaction for cultivar development. *Adv.*
529 *Agronomy* 62, 199-252.

530 KRISHNAMOORTHY, V., and N. KUMAR (2004). Evaluation of parental banana varieties and new
531 hybrids regarding potential yield and resistance to Sigatoka and nematode in India.
532 *Fruits* 59, 159-168.

533 LIN, C. S., M. R. BINNS and L. P. LEFKOVITCH (1986). Stability analysis: Where do we stand?
534 *Crop Sci.* 26, 894-900.

535 MAPELLI, S., C. FROVA, G. TORTI and G. P. SORESSI (1978). Relationship between set,
536 development and activities of growth regulators in tomato berries. *Plant Cell Physiol.*
537 19, 1281-1288.

538 MAZZUCATO, A., A. R. TADDEI and G. P. SORESSI (1998). The *parthenocarpic fruit (pat)* mutant
539 of tomato (*Lycopersicon esculentum* Mill.) sets seedless fruits and has aberrant
540 anther and ovule development. *Development*, 125, 107-114.

541 MAZZUCATO, A., G. TESTA, T. BIANCARI and G. P. SORESSI (1999). Effect of gibberellic acid
542 treatments, environmental conditions, and genetic background on the expression of
543 the parthenocarpic fruit mutation in tomato. *Protoplasma*, 208, 18-25.

544 Okoro, P., Shaibu, A.A., Ude G., Olukolu, B.A., Ingelbrecht, I., Tenkouano, A., Ogburia, M.N,
545 Moonn, F., and Dimkpa, C. (2011). Genetic evidence of developmental components
546 of parthenocarpy in apomictic Mus species. *Journal of Plant Breeding and Crop*
547 *Science* Vol. 3(8), 138-145.

548 ORTIZ, R., (1995). *Musa Genetics in Bananas and Plantains*, edited by S. GOWEN. Chapman
549 and Hall, London.

550 ORTIZ, R., (1997) Occurrence and inheritance of 2n pollen in *Musa*. *Ann. Bot.* 79, 449-453.

- 551 ORTIZ, R., R. B. S. FERRIS and D. VUYLSTEKE (1995). Banana and plantain breeding in
552 *Bananas and plantains*, edited by S. GOWEN. Chapman and Hall, London.
- 553 ORTIZ, R., ULBURGHES, F., OKORO, P. (1998). Seasonal variation of apparent male fertility in
554 plantain and banana. *Hortscience*, 33, 146-148.
- 555 ORTIZ, R., and D. VUYLSTEKE (1995). Effect of the parthenocarpy gene P1 and ploidy in
556 bunch and fruit traits of plantain and banana hybrids. *Heredity*, 75, 460-465.
- 557 ORTIZ, R., and D. VUYLSTEKE (1995). Genotype-by-environment interaction in *Musa*
558 germplasm revealed by multi-site evaluation in sub-Saharan Africa. *Hortscience*, 30,
559 795.
- 560 ORTIZ, R., D. VUYLSTEKE, J. OKORO, A. N. AGBOR, A. N. NWOGU *et al.*, (1995). Multilocal testing of hybrid *Musa* germplasm at IITA and NARS sites in Southeastern Nigeria
561 and Cameroon. *MusAfrica* 6, 18-20.
- 562
- 563 PANDOLFINI, T., G. L. ROTINO, S. CAMERINI, R. DEFEZ and A. SPENA (2002). Optimisation of
564 transgene action at the post-transcriptional level: high quality parthenocarpic fruits in
565 industrial tomatoes. *BMC Biotechnology*, 2, 1-8.
- 566 ROTINO, G. L., E. PERRI, M. ZOTTINI, H. SOMMER and A. SPENA (1997). Genetic engineering of
567 parthenocarpic plants. *Nature Biotech.* 15, 1398-1401.
- 568 ROTINO, G. L., H. SOMMER, H. SAEDLER and A. SPENA (1996). Methods for producing
569 parthenocarpic or female sterile transgenic plants and methods for enhancing fruit
570 setting and development, pp., edited by EPO.
- 571 SANTANGELO, E., and G. P. SORESSI, (1990). La partenocarpia nel pomodoro. *Coltura*
572 *Protette*, 3, 29-33.
- 573 SAS, (1990). *SAS Manual*. SAS Institute, North Carolina.
- 574 SPENA, A., N. FICCADENTI, G. L. ROTINO and R. DEFEZ (1999). Method to modulate the
575 expression of genes inducing the parthenocarpic trait in plants, pp., edited by EPO.
- 576 SPENA, A., and G. L. ROTINO (2001). Parthenocarpy: state of the art, in *Current trends in the*
577 *embryology of angiosperms*. pp. 435-450.
- 578 SWENNEN, R., and D. VUYLSTEKE (1988). Female fertility in plantains. *Musarama*, 1, 4-5.
- 579 SWENNEN, R., D. VUYLSTEKE and K. DE SMET (1991). Seasonal dependent seed set in
580 plantains. *Banana Newsletter*, 14, 35-36.
- 581 VARDY, E., A. LAPUSHNER, A. GENIZI and J. HEWETT (1989). Genetics of parthenocarpy in
582 tomato under a low temperature regime I: Line RP 75/59. *Euphytica*, 41, 1-8.
- 583 VAROQUAUX, F., R. BLANVILLAIN, M. DELSENY and P. GALLOIS (2000). Less is better: new
584 approaches for seedless fruit production. *Trends in Biotechnology*, 18, 233-242.
- 585 VUYLSTEKE, D. (1990a). Shoot-tip culture for the propagation, conservation and exchange of
586 *Musa* germplasm. *Practical Manuals for Handling Crop Germplasm In vitro*. 2
587 IBPGR, Rome, Italy.
- 588 VUYLSTEKE, D. R., R. ORTIZ, R. B. S. FERRIS and J. H. CROUCH (1997). Plantain improvement.
589 *Plant Breeding Rev.* 14, 267-320.