



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_10525
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of Some Plant Methanol Extracts on Egg Hatching and Juvenile Mortality of Root-Knot Nematode <i>Meloidogyne incognita</i>
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	This manuscript is on the nematocidal activity of methanolic extracts of four plant species. According to the reviewer it cannot be published because some critical issues on experiments establishment and conduction are unclear. 10% acetone use for test solutions preparation is not rational. The extracts most probably are water soluble because they are produced with extraction in methanol. Additionally, acetone is very volatile and very toxic to nematodes. If an organic solvent needs to be added for solubility efficiency reasons why not use methanol or DMSO? - Three replications per experimental treatment are very few. At least four should be used. - Line 70. The yield of the extract should be reported so as to be able to calculate the test concentrations. - In line 104 author's report on lack of dose response effect as far as <i>H. lupulus</i> is concerned. How is this justified? - Lines 108 to 109 do not make sense. Does this mean that acetone should be used as a nematocidal agent? - Throughout MS the name <i>M. azedarach</i> is not reported correctly.	-The best solvents probably are the high polarity like ethanol or mixtures water/alcohol (etanol, methanol), but it depends the application. In other hand, acetone is good extraction solvent in many potential applications. it breaks down cells walls. -Several researchers were used three replication in their works. It is enough for me. -I agree with reviewer about name of <i>M. azedarach</i>. I made corrections on MS
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		