



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_11325
Title of the Manuscript:	Ranking traditional rice cultivars based on yield and some morphological traits using path analysis, multi-criteria decision making model and compromise programming
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	This paper is informative and well written but some results need to be elaborated	
<u>Major</u> REVISION comments	Line: 93: "...the values of vectors of ideal points, max and worst..." need more explanations. Line 96: "...to convert all units and make it the same.": sentence need to be re written. Line 101-107: STD AND ACT are not clear, needs to be clearly defined. Line 129: "plant height had the highest direct effect on number of grains per panicle." This can't be generalized. Line 149: table 2: How can Criteria weight be evaluated for the traits calculated? Line 162-164) The definition of the "ideal distance" or Lp is not clear, needs to be clarified.	Amended Revised Defined down the equation The total effect of the parameter on the yield is given in path coefficient. Hence, the contribution of the trait on the yield which is described by the path coefficient was considered as the criteria weight. On the other hand, Criterion weight for the multi criteria decision making model is the decision maker's global preference with respect to the quality of the alternatives required (Goicoechea et al., 1982). Added: The closeness between a solution and an ideal point is measured by a function and this function is called as a family of Lp matrices



SDI Review Form 1.6

	The references are poor and do not usually meet the required information mentioned in the manuscript. Most of them do not have publication date. Some references are not mentioned in the text. Line 202, 247, 258, 266.	Added years to Beuthe and Scannella. And Oad
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	Direct effect, indirect effect, total effect, criteria weight for evaluated traits, relative distance, and compromised distance are not clearly defined. This article does not mention the effect of stresses. In the other way I think that only two (2) seasons are not enough to conclude.	These are common key words in path analysis This is a funded research for 2 year period.