



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                                              |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                                                                                                                 |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2014_AJEA_11720                                                                                                                                                              |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Evaluation of Sustainable Production Practices for Asian Vegetables (Luffa and Bitter Gourd) and their Mineral Nutrient Analysis in a Piedmont Soil of North Carolina</b> |
| Type of the Article      | <b>Original Research Article</b>                                                                                                                                             |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p><b>Abstract,</b><br/>The abstract was not reviewed due to many flaws found in the body of the work that will ultimately affect the abstract.</p> <p><b>Introduction,</b><br/>Page 2 lines: 31-44 should be deleted because it does not have direct bearing with body of the work.<br/>The entire introduction does not have a strong motivation to conduct the study. The introduction doesn't deal with the importance of cover crops in vegetable production and the influence of this technology on the sustainable production of the two vegetables was not properly motivated.</p> <p><b>Materials and methods,</b><br/>Page 3 line 77: title should read: Filed location and Experimentation.<br/>Line 79: add location coordinates at the end of North Carolina<br/>Lines 82-83: not enough information is given on the treatment applied with hanging statement and one is unable to ascertain your treatment arrangement. Did you add NPK mineral fertilizer to the main plots (cover and non-cover)?<br/>Line 83: what is the choice of the NPK combinations used and are the difference in the treatment proportionate?<br/>Lines: 89, 97, and 98 need review; too many typo errors and incomplete or confused statements.<br/>All the scientific names should be written in <i>italics</i> and the generic and specific names of the species used must be written in proper case system.<br/>Lines 117-122: explain your main plots and subplots here with the methods for the separation of means. Is it split-split design in in CRD, RCBD or Latin Square? This will have bearing with your ANOVA.</p> <p><b>Results and discussion,</b><br/>Page 4 line 133-135: Table 1: there is no significant difference at <math>p=0.05</math> between T3 &amp; T4. Therefore, your statement in line 133-135 is not true. For</p> | <p>Thank you for all the comments and suggestions. I have made the changes recommended and modified the way the results were presented to match with the data furnished in the tables.</p> <p>Specific comments: The reviewer's comments for Table 2, its only one table for the two vegetables separated by a dividing line, this will help the reader to go through the analysis easily without any problem.</p> <p>Thank you</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|-----------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|                                         | <p>the main plot treatments, T3 &amp; T4 are different significantly different from T1 and T2. That is what you need to report.</p> <p>Table 2: I have a problem with this table. This is not the ANOVA summary table for a split-split plot design. The Main plot and the split plot errors are missing and these two tables in Table 2 are supposed to be on same table with the same DF, SS, MS, F &amp; P.as presented, it needs a major review because all the main plot and subplot errors are not supplied.</p> <p>Page 5 line: treatment should be removed</p> <p>Lines 178-184: was temperature part of the study and how was yield correlated with temperature and was this measured during the course of the study? If yes, please add to your materials and methods.</p> <p>Page 6 lines193-194: ‘These two factors’: what two factors were you referring to here?</p> <p>The enter result and discussion part of the script was purely presentation of ‘results’. The work was not discussed at all! Authors need to discuss the results of the study.</p> <p><b>Conclusion,</b></p> <p>Page 7 lines 226-229: the author cannot draw this conclusion because the economics of producing at fertilizer level T4 has not been tested against profitability bearing in mind that the yield at T4 is not significantly different from T3.</p> <p>Lines 231-233: the authors cannot draw this conclusion because the result of the mineralisation of the incorporated crops into the soil was not presented in this work.</p> <p>I hope this helps?</p> |  |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |