



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_12729
Title of the Manuscript:	Urea Fertilization: Effects on growth, nutrient uptake and root development of the biodiesel plant, castor bean (<i>Ricinus communis</i> L).
Type of the Article	

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	As the experimental design was described, the total plots number was very low (16) and the DF (degrees of freedom) of Error was 9. In the agricultural research is recommended a total of plots > 20 and DF of Error > 10. Furthermore, the number of plants in each parcel was not described. For the reasons considering the statistical procedures as they were done, I decline the acceptance of the present manuscript for being published in the American Journal of Experimental Agriculture.	As the primary author, I disagree with the reviewer's comments. For information, this is an indoor pot (One seed/pot means 1 plant/pot-mentioned in the text) experiment under controlled condition. In indoor experiment, we can work with at least 3 treatments and 3 replications. Also to get sustainable feedstock of biodiesel from castor not much work was done on fertilizer implications. Besides for production of fuel we need to establish the fertilizer recommendation to get good seed yield and production of crude oil, so we need further studies in future based on this experiment. >20 and E< 10 is arbitrary, and even then, the number of plots and df met appropriate standard. This is key information that needs to be published so future studies can build on this research
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		As the primary author, I disagree with the reviewer's comments. For information, this is an indoor pot (1 plant / pot) experiment under controlled condition. In indoor experiment, we can work with at least 3 treatments and 3 replications. Also to get sustainable feedstock of biodiesel from castor not much work was done on fertilizer implications. Besides, for the production of fuel we need to establish the fertilizer recommendation to get good seed yield and production of crude oil, so we need further studies in future based on this experiment. >20 and E>10 is arbitrary, and even then, the number of plots and df met appropriate standard. This is key information that needs to be published so future studies can build on this research.
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		