



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_13087
Title of the Manuscript:	Analysis of Seed Vigor Responses in Soybean to Invasive Silver Carp (<i>Hypophthalmichthys molitrix</i>) Protein Hydrolysate Treatments
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	At what temperature was the seeds kept immersed in FPH solution for 24 hrs? At room temperature, the FPH solution gets spoiled What may be the economic feasibility of using the FPH instead of other sources for improving the seed vigor?	The seeds were immersed in FPH solution at 22oC. However, the amount of FPH added 5% (w/v). We run several preliminary tests to ensure that spoilage was not occurring at this concentration and storage conditions. The FPH solution remained stable over this period of time and at this temperature. This is an economically feasible method of improving crop vigor. According to the FAO (2012) Asian Carp is priced at \$0.50/kg. Amount of fish and enzyme used was minimal. The production itself was not labor intensive. A typical seed treatment or seed vigor enhancement can run up to \$475 per gallon (Cruiser Maxx). As indicated in the manuscript, our intent was to generate a value-added product (i.e. FPH) from an underutilized and invasive fish species.
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		