



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                   |
|--------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                                                                      |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2013_AJEA_6197                                                                                                                    |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Effects of variety on yield and water productivity of fadama-grown rice ( <i>Oryza sativa</i> L.) in Akure, southwestern Nigeria. |
| Type of the Article      |                                                                                                                                   |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                            | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                               |
|--------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments | The regression model should be stated in the methodology and numbered accordingly. The F-ratio should also be reported in the results and discussion section to ascertain the overall significance of the model in line with traditional practice. Observation showed that 3 functional forms were tried and expectedly, a lead equation should be selected on the basis of statistical properties of the result and then reported. This is important and should be established in the results. Given that the Hausa term, Fadama may be novel to vast majority of readers, efforts should be made to throw more light on it. | The regression model is stated in the methodology and numbered accordingly.<br>The F-ratio is reported<br>A lead equation is selected on the basis of statistical properties of the result and reported.<br>Given that the Hausa term, Fadama is explained in text |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments      | In a lot of places (lines 43, 48, 55, 61, 62, 63, 67, 69, 71, 73, 75, 81, 83, 84, 287, 288, 299, 358, 360, 362, 369 etc), et al should be italicized.<br>Lines 272 – 283 cannot be categorized as discussion rather it was stressing more on the methodology.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Words in lines 43, 48, 55, 61, 62, 63, 67, 69, 71, 73, 75, 81, 83, 84, 287, 288, 299, 358, 360, 362, 369 are italicized.<br>Lines 272 – 283 is taken to methodology.                                                                                               |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments    | The article is innovative and followed anticipated scientific processes in the methodology.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Thank you                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |