



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_7082
Title of the Manuscript:	Effects of the Foam of Sugarcane (<i>Sacharum officinarum</i> L.) and Inorganic Fertilizer on the Chemical Characteristics of a Tropical Cambisol
Type of the Article	

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	The content of this paper is quite interesting. The paper appears as a technical report, very descriptive. - The main flaw is the lack of replicates during the samples collection, treatment and preservation. - The quality control and quality assurance of the analytical method are not performed in the present study. -The references must all be in the appropriate format and it is not acceptable to have some journal titles abbreviated, some with full stops and some without and other journal titles in full. Put them all in the correct house style.	- Composite samples were taken only before the trial for foam and soil analysis. But, after the experiment, every year, soil samples were taken by treatment. -The quality control method of laboratory analysis is given in sub-section 5.2 (L99-101). -Done: see the reference list
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	- I suggest include some of the references: Garcia Navarro F., Amoros J.A., Sánchez C., Bravo S. y R. Jiménez Ballesta (2009). Application of sugar foam to red soils in a semiarid Mediterranean environment." Environ. Earth Sci. 58, 3: 603-611.	Included in the discussion: sub-section 4-2 (L264)



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Perez-de-los-Reyes C., Amoros-Ortiz-Villajos J.A., Garcia-Navarro F.J., Bravo Martin-Consuegra S., Sanchez-Jimenez C., Chocano-Etesona D. & Jimenez-Ballesta R. (2011). Changes in water retention properties due to the application of sugar foam in red soils. <i>Agricultural Water Management</i> 98: 1834–1839. Perez-de-los-Reyes C., Amoros-Ortiz-Villajos J.A., Garcia-Navarro F.J., Bravo Martin-Consuegra S. & Jimenez-Ballesta R. (2013). Grapevine leaf uptake of mineral elements influenced by sugar foam amendment of an acidic soil. <i>Vitis</i> 51 (3), 111–118. - The paper was very poorly checked prior to submission so there are many stylistic inconsistencies. As a result of this and the above it needs major revision prior to publication. - If the authors take more care in the rewritten manuscript they would have a useful contribution to the literature.	Included in the discussion: sub-section 4-1 (L216). Not found Manuscript was now edited according to authors and reviewer 3. Done as well as
--	--	--