



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                           |
|--------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>              |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2013_AJEA_8682                                                            |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Assessment of Genetic variability within the genus <i>Citrus</i> in Syria |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                 |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|-------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The manuscript is sufficiently robust and technically sound. It is well written and assembled. I recommend it be accepted, after the needed alterations shown below are performed.</li> <li>2. Materials &amp; methods - The methods show suitability, adequate technical standards and sufficient details so that the procedures can be replicated elsewhere. However, some methodological details should be mentioned or even discussed, such as: (A) SSR pairs have a high level of variation, but also important advantages which should be emphasized, (B) The number of SSR pairs utilized in this study is not expressive as compared to other reports, and (C) There exist other genomic libraries of <i>Citrus</i>, such as <i>C. maxima</i>, <i>C. medica</i>, <i>C. reticulata</i> and <i>C. unshiu</i>.</li> <li>3. Results &amp; discussion - 1. The data are well controlled and robust. 2. Relevant and current references are provided during discussion. 3. Discussion and conclusions are based on actual facts and figures, no biased claims detected. 4. The statistical analyses are sufficient and appropriate, and the corresponding sources adequately cited.</li> <li>4. Conclusion – The Conclusion is supported by the data, and discussed inside the manuscript. The authors provide adequate proof for their claims without overselling them. However, the Conclusion falls short of indicating further possibilities of progress from the findings. One of them could be implications for <i>Citrus</i> breeding programs. Another one could be the comparison of the genetic diversity in Syria with the ones reported elsewhere.</li> <li>5. References - All the references cited are relevant and adequate. However, I consider that not all suitable current references are cited. I strongly suggest the inclusion of</li> </ol> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. OK</li> <li>2. (B). The number of primers used was enough to detect and understand the genetic diversity between and within the 4 groups of Citrus.</li> <li>2. (C). This work was the first attempt to characterise and to study the genetic diversity in the Citrus in Syria with SSR, therefore we concentrate on one genomic library, others library could be used in the other steps of the program.</li> <li>3. Results and Discussion: OK.</li> <li>4. Conclusion:<br/>Remarks were taken in consideration.<br/>Reference suggested was added.</li> <li>5- the suggested paper was included.</li> </ol> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |       |
|-----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
|                                         | the following paper: "~~~~~". This report shows a close relation to the observations with the Orange Group, and – evidently – opposing profiles relative to the Lemon group. Those workers suggest that the low genetic variability was probably due to propagation of a small number of cultivars. I suggest the authors consider including a remark in the text regarding this matter. |       |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   | The manuscript needs a minor linguist review (e.g. 3 <sup>rd</sup> , 4 <sup>th</sup> and 5 <sup>th</sup> paragraphs of page 7).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Done. |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments | From my point of view, there is no ethical issue in this manuscript.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |       |