SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	**American Journal of Experimental Agriculture**
Manuscript Number:	**2014_AJEA_10502**
Title of the Manuscript:	**Performance, haematology and serum biochemical indices of broiler chickens fed toasted sesame seed (Sesamum indicum, Linn) meal based-diets**
Type of the Article	**Original Research Article**

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.
To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline)

SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Compulsory REVISION comments	**Some phrases need to be better explained** **- Line 36** Sesame seed (benniseed) is produced locally… – the question is where ? **- Lines 37 and 38** Sesame seed is rich in leucine, arginine and methionine, but relatively low in lysine. Compared to which ingredient ? **- Lines 42 and 43** Sesame meal is an excellent source of protein (47.1%) (9) to (52.9%) (10) 42 and has amino acid composition similar to that of soybean meal (47.7%). Is it not a contradiction compared to the observation above ? **- Lines 59 to 61** Each treatment was replicated three times with a total of twelve birds per replicate. The toasted sesame seed was included at graded levels viz; 0 (T1), 25 (T2), 50 (T3), 75 (T4) and 100% (T5) in broiler diets. These levels are included in diets or replaced soybean meal ? **- Line 61** The diets with water were offered to the respective birds *ad libitum*. I suggest you simplify it to "The diets and water were offered to birds *ad libitum*." **- Line 80** **Table 1: Composition (g/100gDM) of experimental diets** Why did you use just two diets ? I really would like to see the sesame meal inclusion in diets, because it is important in broiler	Sesame seed is produced locally in Nigeria. This has been reflected in the text in line 36 Compared to Soybean In our opinion it is not a contradiction. Both Sesame and Soybean are legumes with similar but not same amino acids profile. However, relatively, soybean is richer in lysine while sesame is richer in methionine. We think the statements sufficiently indicated their peculiarities The levels were in the diet to replace Full fat soyabean Corrections noted and have been appropriately reflected The modalities of replacement of the soybean in the basal diet to obtain the

	acceptance in field. You did just one blood collection, why ? the best results can be observed in the starter phase. **- Line 93 and 94** It could also be attributed to the anti-nutritional factors contained in the seed as earlier remarked. I believe you must determine these components, it is really important in order to explain the variations observed in hematological variables. This is essential for your discussion. Sesame cultivars can vary according to soil, weather and storing conditions around the world. **- Line 112** **Table 2: Performance of broilers fed graded toasted sesame seed based diets (0- 8weeks)** Your data are really below the expected for modern broilers. You should explain in material and methods the raising condition of theses broilers in order to understand what happened in your assay Is it really your experimental conditions these ones ? the low performance results are normal for you ? Why didn't you show us the results after 21 days of experiment ? The starter diets performance data should appear separated from the total ones. **- Figures 1 to 5** These figures are repeating the results showed in tables. You have to choose the best way that you believe is better for your experiment. Or tables, or figures. **- Conclusion (page 284)** Toasted sesame seed could be incorporated up to 22% in the diets of broiler chickens without any adverse effect on performance, haematological parameters and serum biochemical indices. You should point us what is the level of soybean substitution and level of inclusion of sesame meal in diets. These informations are useful for broiler industry.	experimental diets were duly explained in the methods. It will only mean a mere repetition. We are however not having any issue contrary to the opinion of the reviewers on this and have therefore included the details of the dietary composition in the text In the present study, authors did not collect blood at the starter phase separately as rightly remarked. Also, the anti nutritional factors assay, cultivars variability due to soil and the storing conditions were not taken into account. We believe these innate variability should be subject of separate discourse or a follow up research While it may be true that the performance data was below the expected for modern broilers, we must take cognisance of the fact that the experiment was undertaken in tropical environment using Abhor acre chickens. A look at the data obtained for birds on control (T1) diet confirmed this. Nevertheless, the experiment was appropriately designed and executed and the data collected were true observation from the experiment. Results and figures are not same at all. Regression figures were obtained from the results and it is with the notion of predicting and/or explaining relationships among the variables studied. Noted, this will be appropriately reflected in the relevant portion of the conclusion

Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments	The article needs to be deeply revised for publication. Important information were not showed like performance from 1 to 21 days of age and the amount of anti-nutritional factors in sesame meal. Information about chicks and broiler raising conditions like, area, population density, feed bromatological analysis, and clear the level of inclusion of sesame meal.	Noted. However, separate data were not collected for starter performance in this study as earlier stated. So also is the anti nutritional factors in sesame meal. Information on the chick and broiler raising condition, area, population density, feed and haematological issues now properly reflected in the text and the level of sesame inclusion explicit