



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_10525
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of Some Plant Methanol Extracts on Egg Hatching and Juvenile Mortality of Root-Knot Nematode <i>Meloidogyne incognita</i>

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Unfortunately your answers to the revision comments do not change the reviewer's decision on the manuscript. The MS must be rejected because 10% of acetone is toxic to nematodes! This interferes with the validity of the results of the paper! Solubility and extraction capacity are other issues that do not have to do with nematodes mortality. Basic experimental establishment procedures should always exclude mortality of nematodes in the carrier control, and I do not think this is the case here!	There is no literature about 10% acetone toxic to nematodes. If reviewer had come to this conclusion over the tables, we can not say this. In both trials (egg hatching and larvae mortality), 10% acetone was used as control.