



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_10802
Title of the Manuscript:	EFFECTS OF CLIMATE CHANGE CRITICAL FACTORS ON THE SEEDLING GROWTH AND DEVELOPMENT OF MAIZE (<i>Zea mays L.</i>)
Type of the Article	

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Overall, I have a problem with the starting hypothesis of this work; it presumes reduction in solar radiation (as simulated by the shading experiment) is the expected scenario under climate change. But this is not the case. Other specific issues are: (1) Introduction lacks freshness and originality and it's too long (2) Methodology section lacks clarity in most cases. For instance, (a) authors say they use split-plot design but fail to indicate the main-plot and sub-plot factors (b) A replication of n=3 for a plot experiment is too small, especially when using a split-plot design (results in too low degree of freedom), (c) a row spacing of 0.25cm does not make sense and (d) statistical analysis section is not described clearly and properly. (3) No indication of statistical significance on the results (tables) and discussions are out of sync with results, in most cases and (4) There is no need to do a test to reach a conclusion like the authors' because what they wrote is just a common knowledge. Details are to be found in the pdf document.	Title: "EFFECTS OF CLIMATE CHANGE CRITICAL FACTORS ON THE SEEDLING GROWTH AND DEVELOPMENT OF MAIZE (<i>Zea mays L.</i>)". These factors do not work separately but interact and modify the environment On the 14th of June, 2014 the author replied the reviewer's comments. Line14 -Please check Table 2 18-Control is (WN) water and direct sunlight, while drought (water stress) is WN1 Line 28-Critical factors are temperature, water and light, but the most critical factor is water stress drought. Line142- Check Table2 Line148- Please check author's comments of 14th of June, 2014. Line150-I feel 3 replicates are Ok for



SDI Review Form 1.6

		standard scientific work. Line161-Has been corrected earlier. The roman numerals for Tables have been corrected in revised work
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		