



**SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1**

**PART 1:**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                                    |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                                                                                                       |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2014_AJEA_12469                                                                                                                                                    |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Side effects of sublethal concentration of two Neonicotinoids; Thiamethoxam and Thiacloprid on the larval parasitoid, Bracon brevicornis (Hymenoptera: Braconidae) |

**PART 2:**

| FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Authors' response to final evaluator's comments                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>I honestly feel very disappointed with the revised manuscript. The authors have barely followed my previous indications. Please, see in next paragraphs a detailed report. Nevertheless, I consider the manuscript suitable for publication regarding the scientific points of view. However, to my opinion still there are lot of editorial points to introduce in order to improve aesthetics.</p> <p>1 Regarding my previous concern about language authors have only corrected the example. The problem is much more larger than this. I will try to be more specific:<br/>Line 13: Thiacloprid have high toxic effect must be Thiacloprid have higher toxic effect than ...<br/>Line 41: Neonicotinoids acts ... should be Neonicotinoids act<br/>Line 44: It binds... when it is speaking about neonicotinoids (plural form)<br/>Line 68: "in order to select the safer form..." should be "in order to select the safest form..."</p> <p>2 Other problems linguistic: Name of chemicals or groups of chemicals (neonicotinoids, thiacloprid, thiamethoxam) should not be stated in capital letters.</p> <p>3 Regarding my previous concern for the use of abbreviations: i) Nicotinic acetylcholine receptor is abbreviated in line 29 and is cited without abbreviations in next sentence (line 31) and in line 44; ii) Integrated pest management is defined as IPM at least twice (lines 25 and 51).</p> <p>4 I previously raised my doubts regarding the moment of the exposure. Authors have replied in the commenting table, but nothing it is done in the manuscript. Thus, I think that doubts might be still present for readers.</p> <p>5 I previously objected because the text was a mere repetition of numbers displayed in the Table, but authors did nothing about it.</p> <p>6 I still think that the authors should state the total composition of the pesticide products in the text, not in the commenting table that will not available to readers.</p> <p>7 To my opinion the text is still very hard for readers non familiar with entomology.</p> <p>OTHER CONCENRS:</p> <p>Lines 95-97: "Direct toxicity to the parasitoid adults was measured by spray method on the inner surface of the glass tubes with 10 individuals per tube and repeated ten times" Does it mean that ten exposures were repeated with the same glass tube (for a total of 10 exposed animals), or ten different exposures with 10 sets of different animals each of them with 10 individuals (for a total of 100 exposed animals).</p> | <p><b>We did them in this version</b></p> <p><b>We modified them in this version</b></p> <p><b>We arranged them in this version to be abbreviations only at the second, third,... time</b></p> <p><b>This is indicated in lines 98 – 101.</b></p> <p><b>We summarized it in this version</b></p> <p><b>We arranged them in this version</b></p> <p><b>I hope to be easy now after your valuable corrections</b></p> <p>Ten different exposures with 10 sets of different animals each of them with 10 individuals (for a total of 100 exposed animals). We explained that in the text in the current version.</p> |



**SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1**

Table 2: It would be better if it is stated that sex ratio really means (females/total individuals)

**Yes, we corrected them in line 128**

Table 2 and Table 3: I assume statistical significance is for p lower than 0.01 and 0.05, but it is stated for p higher than 0.01 and 0.05.

**Yes, we corrected them.**