



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012 AJEA 2718
Title of the Manuscript:	Diversity and Community Structure of Benthic Insects in Fish Farm Ponds in Southern Côte d'Ivoire, West Africa.

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Overall: The revised paper is much more interesting and does a better job of relating the observed insect communities to the habitat conditions. Minor edits: Throughout – the authors use a mix of past and present tense when describing the study and results. Normally one would stick with one tense throughout the paper. This is up to the editors and authors if they want to change it. 2.1 delete 2nd printing of “surrounding ecosystems comprised of agricultural landscape.” 2.1 Add sentence stating that the ponds contain no vegetation. 2.4 Add “(16 taxa)” after “principal taxa”. Various places – authors use the term “unregistered” and I have no idea what they mean by that. To me unregistered would be similar to unrecorded or not measured, which does not make sense. Various places – authors use the term “On the other hand” or “In the other hand” to much and in most cases it would be better deleted. 3.1 rephrase to say “... food is regularly supplied to fish, in contrast to other active farms that receive less rice bran. The varying levels of nutrients between farms are likely due to an unequal distribution of fish food inputs among farms.” 3.1 “priests” – is this a typo? Local term? I don't know how ponds can be priests. 3.2 replace “these” with “those” in the sentence “... Chironomids were more extensive than THOSE of any other group...” Fig 2. It would be very helpful to have straight vertical lines running through each of the graphs between the months denoting which time periods are dry versus. 3.3 Delete sentence “It this stations, the highest density and biomass were observed during the dry season.” This statement is repeated from the sentence above. 3.3 last sentence, last words, exchange “this season” to “dry season”. 3.4 Delete sentence “The high evenness index justify this situation.” Not needed and idea is repeated below. 3.4 Cut the sentences “With regard... oscillate between 0.86 and 2.13.” unless you explain in more detail the studies this comparison came from (habitat, season, sampling, taxonomic detail, etc.). Without that detail you can't compare between studies, only sites within a study. 3.5 Add main point that the CCA indicates that station has a greater influence on insect communities than season. 3.5 It does not look like Caenis is associated with high pH, temp, or DO values. Do you mean Tanypus? 4. Add a sentence to the conclusion something like “Community differences are correlated to environmental variables of water temperature and chemistry, and to pond substrate.”	Ok, We did it Ok, we did it Ok, we did it Ok, we corrected it Ok, we corrected it Ok, We did it Ok, we did it I'm not agree Ok, we did it Ok, we did it Ok, we did it Ok, we did it Ok, we did it You are right, We are wrong, it is <i>Tanypus fuscus</i>. Ok, we did it