

-----Original Message-----

From: XXX YYY<xxx@yyy.zzz>

Sent: Sat, Nov 16, 2013 at 1:47 AM

To: Managing Editor

Subject: RE: Request for final decision for manuscript numFlorence Mtambanengweber
2013_AJEA_5787

Firstly, -All soil and evapotrans. Data surely had more than one value per sample, implying that what we see documented here are the means, thus we could also see the sd or se (LSD), and even error bars on the graphs. Otherwise if the results are from just one sample, then this is not representative. I know all about composite samples, and multiple data sets can be obtained from these in the laboratory.

Also on the issue of SOM quality, there is no evidence that this was tested (through mineralization studies), therefore I still think the determination of soil organic C was for concentration and not quality. You get C:N ratios from amounts and not quality. This should be re-visited.

Finally, I missed this the first time round, i.e. the continual reference to Tables 5, then 3, and then 4. Normally this should be projected in a chronological order, for ease of reading.

The repetition I meant concerning rating of total N values are still evident in lines: 170-171 and lines 172-174. What is the difference between these 2 lines.

Editor's Details:

Florence Mtambanengwe

Department of Soil Science & Agricultural Engineering, University of Zimbabwe, Zimbabwe

Note: Modification was done in this document ONLY to hide the email id.