SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	**American Journal of Experimental Agriculture**
Manuscript Number:	**2013_AJEA_6352**
Title of the Manuscript:	**IMPACT OF WATER LOSSES AND MAINTENANCE OF CANAL IRRIGATION SYSTEM ON AGRICULTURE**
Type of the Article	**Research Paper**

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.
To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline)

SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Compulsory REVISION comments	1 Kindly improve English of the manuscript. Line 11, 12, 13, 14 the sentences need to be re-written. Line no 34, 35, 36: the following sentence needs to be rewritten in good English "It has been revealed by a number of investigations that most of the watercourses out of the total 5400 watercourses in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province of Pakistan are improperly designed, carelessly operated and poorly maintained [2]". 2 Kindly explain clearly that how present study is different from Khan [1], Khattak et al. [2], Hagan [3], Rehmat [4], Kamper [5], Ejaz [6], Alam [7], Whiting and Javed [10], Langely and Roob [11] and Eire and Leonard [12]. 3 Explain how the study will add into the knowledge in this field of specialization. **In the light of 2 and 3 above kindly re-write the introduction and problem statement.** 4 Line No 53 to 55 kindly rewrite the sentence "The steady state water losses due to seepage through the channel sections and direct evaporation from the channel and	

		operational or transient losses due to change in the operation of system such as advance and recession times of the channel and opening and closing of outlets have caused considerable reduction in the agricultural production on a large scale.	
	5	Line 78 79 Kindly improve English in “The fig 1 shows the location of Peshawar in Pakistan and gives an idea about the Kabul River movement from Pakistan entering the Afghanistan”.	
	6	Kindly provide latitude and longitudes of the canal under study.	
	7	Line Kindly units consistent. Kindly use MKS System of units throughout the paper. Units are not consistent in line 87, 88---The total length, design discharge and culturable command area of the minor are respectively 21200 ft, 12.5 cusecs and 1312 hectares.	
	8	Unit of design discharge and total length are missing in Table 1. on Page 4.	
	9	In Table 1 on page 4, the abbreviations “L”, R and T.R need to be defined like “L” is for “left”, “R” is for “Right” etc.	
	10	Kindly write Equation No in front of every equation.	
	11	Kindly provide reference from where the equation for seepage rate at line 114 has been taken.	
	12	Kindly explain abbreviations/symbols used in any equation in form of a paragraph. Defining only one symbol in a full line is wastage of space and increases the length of paper just for nothing.	

SDI Review Form 1.6

	13 The Table No and its title is missing for Table between lines 190 and 191. 14 Kindly provide North-South indicator in Figure 1 and Figure 2. 15 Kindly justify that a study conducted in 2005 is still valid and can be published in 2013 because many changes have occurred during the last decade. 16 I think instead of “inflow-outflow method” the “mass balance equation” should be used. 17 References are very old. The problem under study is a hot issue and many papers have been published on efficiency of irrigation canals in recent past. Literature review needs to be strengthened by adding references from recent publications. 18 Cropping pattern and crop-water requirements should be added in the manuscript.	
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		

Reviewer Details:

Name:	**Abdul Razzaq Ghumman**
Department, University & Country	**University of Engineering and Technology Taxila, Pakistan**