



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_8670
Title of the Manuscript:	Long-Term Fertilization Effect On Agronomic Yield And Soil Organic Carbon Under Semi-Arid Mediterranean Region
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	Line 6 – could remove the sub-heading Line 7 – ‘affects’ instead of effects Line 1 and 7 – ‘agronomic yield’; choose between ‘agronomic’ Line 1and Line 36, ‘yield of agricultural crops’ Line 41 and 43, ‘crops yield’ Line 71, 99, 102, 166. Line 9, 39, 43,46 and 48- ‘soil quality’; choose between soil quality and ‘soil fertility’ Line 52, and ‘soil productivity’ Line 70. Line 13 – could remove the sub-heading. Line 14 – could delete ‘because of an increase in’ and after production add – ‘increased as’--- Line 53 – instead of ‘biology’ it should be ‘biological’. Line 63 – after biomass add ‘production’. Line 72 – after less add ‘organic matter’. Line 73 – after ‘long term’, add ‘of’, after ‘years’ it should be experiments, after SOC, add ‘is’ and after ‘affected’ it should be ‘by’ instead of ‘with’ Line 77 – after ‘crop’ it should be ‘species’ instead of ‘speacies’. Line 91-95 could be in one line separated by comas.	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	1. Line2 – Effect on Agronomic Yield, yet in the objective of the study, Line 99 and Line 102, it is cop yield. 2. I see the following specific aspects of the study; (i) Judicious use of organic and inorganic fertilisers improves SOC. (ii) Trends of SOC, N and CEC depending on treatments.	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	(iii) Relationship between SOC and crop yield. 3. Need to choose a crop you would consider to be a test crop, ie maize, a cereal, responds readily to OM or N application, rather than dealing with so many crops. 4. Also you could choose one soil depth instead of dealing with results of two soil depths either 0-15 cm or 15-30 cm. depending on the rooting depth of the crop. 5. You could consider Tables of results as follows; <u>Table 1: Trend of SOC with the treatments</u> <table> <tr> <th><u>Treatment</u></th> <th><u>Initial</u></th> <th><u>1999</u></th> <th><u>2002</u></th> <th><u>2004</u></th> <th><u>2005</u></th> <th><u>2008</u></th> <th><u>2010</u></th> <th><u>Mn</u></th> </tr> <tr><td>Control</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>NPK</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Compost</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Anim Man</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>AMF</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td><u>Mean</u></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> </table> <u>Table 2: Trend of N with the treatments</u> <table> <tr> <th><u>Treatment</u></th> <th><u>Initial</u></th> <th><u>1999</u></th> <th><u>2002</u></th> <th><u>2004</u></th> <th><u>2005</u></th> <th><u>2008</u></th> <th><u>2010</u></th> <th><u>Mn</u></th> </tr> <tr><td>Control</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>NPK</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Compost</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Anim Man</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>AMF</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td><u>Mean</u></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> </table> <u>Table 3: Trend of CEC with the treatments</u> <table> <tr> <th><u>Treatment</u></th> <th><u>Initial</u></th> <th><u>1999</u></th> <th><u>2002</u></th> <th><u>2004</u></th> <th><u>2005</u></th> <th><u>2008</u></th> <th><u>2010</u></th> <th><u>Mn</u></th> </tr> <tr><td>Control</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>NPK</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Compost</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>Anim Man</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>AMF</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td><u>Mean</u></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> </table>	<u>Treatment</u>	<u>Initial</u>	<u>1999</u>	<u>2002</u>	<u>2004</u>	<u>2005</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2010</u>	<u>Mn</u>	Control									NPK									Compost									Anim Man									AMF									<u>Mean</u>									<u>Treatment</u>	<u>Initial</u>	<u>1999</u>	<u>2002</u>	<u>2004</u>	<u>2005</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2010</u>	<u>Mn</u>	Control									NPK									Compost									Anim Man									AMF									<u>Mean</u>									<u>Treatment</u>	<u>Initial</u>	<u>1999</u>	<u>2002</u>	<u>2004</u>	<u>2005</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2010</u>	<u>Mn</u>	Control									NPK									Compost									Anim Man									AMF									<u>Mean</u>									
<u>Treatment</u>	<u>Initial</u>	<u>1999</u>	<u>2002</u>	<u>2004</u>	<u>2005</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2010</u>	<u>Mn</u>																																																																																																																																																																																							
Control																																																																																																																																																																																															
NPK																																																																																																																																																																																															
Compost																																																																																																																																																																																															
Anim Man																																																																																																																																																																																															
AMF																																																																																																																																																																																															
<u>Mean</u>																																																																																																																																																																																															
<u>Treatment</u>	<u>Initial</u>	<u>1999</u>	<u>2002</u>	<u>2004</u>	<u>2005</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2010</u>	<u>Mn</u>																																																																																																																																																																																							
Control																																																																																																																																																																																															
NPK																																																																																																																																																																																															
Compost																																																																																																																																																																																															
Anim Man																																																																																																																																																																																															
AMF																																																																																																																																																																																															
<u>Mean</u>																																																																																																																																																																																															
<u>Treatment</u>	<u>Initial</u>	<u>1999</u>	<u>2002</u>	<u>2004</u>	<u>2005</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2010</u>	<u>Mn</u>																																																																																																																																																																																							
Control																																																																																																																																																																																															
NPK																																																																																																																																																																																															
Compost																																																																																																																																																																																															
Anim Man																																																																																																																																																																																															
AMF																																																																																																																																																																																															
<u>Mean</u>																																																																																																																																																																																															



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<u>Table 4: Trend of Maize yield --/ha with the treatments</u> <u>Teatment 1999 2002 2004 2005 2008 2010 Mean</u> Control NPK Compost Anim Man AMF <u>Mean -----</u> The years indicated are the years of the maize crop. The results of Tables 1, 2 and 3 after being discussed on their own, would perhaps also be used to explain results of Table 4. 6. In my view, if these few tables are acceptable to you, they could be easier for the reader instead of the many loaded tables and graphs. 7. It looks, results are restated without scientific explanations, ie, the why behind the results. 8. Line 289, 291 and 295 – there may be no need for numbering. 9. Notice that your introduction is so long compared to the results and discussion. Some of the literature cited in the introduction may be used to support the discussion of the results.	
--	---	--

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Kato Habib
Department, University & Country	Agriculture Department, Kyambogo University, Uganda