



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_10416
Title of the Manuscript:	Health Status of Spring Barley Grown on Alfisol as Affected by Catch Crop
Type of the Article	Original Research

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	Data and analysis: 1) There was no significant difference among treatments in all the three years or at least two of the three years. But, the authors showed differences for the average values. This results from incorrect analysis and certainly leads to erroneous conclusion. By incorrectly pooling together the data, the authors basically changed the story. 2) It appears that disease development was low, except for root rot and <i>Fusarium</i> spp. Under such conditions, it is hard to say for sure, if the catch crop had an effect or not. I would suggest focusing on the two diseases or overall disease pressure if there was any data of that kind. 3) The manuscript is well structured, but yet needs significant grammatical corrections. It is not publishable as it is now. I am not sure if the journal editorial office can take care of that.	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Yadeta Anbessa Kabeta
Department, University & Country	Research Scientist - Nitrogen Use Efficiency Field Crop Development Centre 5030- 50th Street Lacombe, Alberta, Canada