



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                      |
|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                         |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2014_AJEA_8999                                                                       |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Sugars in Whole Sesame Seed : Effects of Cultivars, Planting Dates, and Row Spacings |
| Type of the Article      |                                                                                      |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                                                                                                                 | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | <b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b><u>Compulsory</u></b> REVISION comments<br>L 21-38<br><br>L 42-43<br><br>L 45-54<br><br>L48<br>L 57-64<br>L 66-69<br><br>L70 | Introduction lacks detail and why is there a need to characterize the sugar composition of sesame seed?<br>Explain<br>Combine subheadings into one. Do not need a one sentence subheading<br>Lack of detail in this section. What type of planter? Seeding rate? Raised beds? Plot length? Weather conditions in each year during growing season? How was sesame harvested? etc<br>List planting dates in order. July 9 before July 17<br>Again, a lack of detail<br>Years also had an effect on fructose, total sugars, and raffinose<br>How can you say an early May planting? May 23 is not early |                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments<br>L 6<br>L 8 and elsewhere in manuscript<br>L 25<br>L 30<br>L 30<br>L 33                 | Remove ( ) from g/100g meal<br>Change percent to %<br>850 million what? Dollars?<br>Latin name for tobacco<br>Peanuts are still grown in VA, so the crop is not lost. Do you mean a reduction in acreage? explain<br>Latin name of sesame already stated above (L 22)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                             |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |  |
|-----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| <b><u>Optional/General</u> comments</b> | <p>I rejected this manuscript (and quit reviewing after the section on planting dates, L 76) because of 2 factors. 1) too little detail in the Introduction and Material and Methods section and 2) this research is not replicated over time. The manuscript basically is one yr of research on late May to early June planting dates and one yr of research on July planting dates. You cannot draw any conclusions on planting dates so far apart in separate years. Temperature, rainfall, and other factors are so different during those time periods that I would not want to attempt to accurately predict results. I suggest that the authors do at least another yr of research to approximate May 23, June 8, July 9 and July 17 planting dates. Dates do not have to be exact but as close as possible to the above mentioned dates.</p> |  |
|-----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|

**Note: Anonymous Reviewer**