



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_9843
Title of the Manuscript:	EVALUATION OF AFLP MARKERS FOR SCREENING RESISTANCE TO COMMON BEAN ROOT ROT (Pythium spp.)

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Information on the heredity and pathogenicity are still weak. The author should describe from where you referred (or how you scored) resistant or susceptible in Table 1 in Materials and Methods. In addition, You can say nothing about pathogenicity in Fig. 3 without pathogenicity test. I found some mismatches of cluster when we compare those in Fig. 1 and Fig. 3. Cluster 2 in Fig. 1 corresponds with cluster 1 in Fig. 3. Cluster 3 in Fig. 1 corresponds with Cluster 4 in Fig. 3. Cluster1 in Fig. 1 seems to correspond with cluster 5, 7 and 8 in Fig. 3. Mw001 is out of the cluster in Fig. 1 but categorized into cluster 8 in Fig 3. Those clustering may have a linkage with pathogenicity (resistant or susceptible), but we cannot judge this validity because of no information on pathogenicity of the germplasm except some germplasm already evaluated in Table 1.	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Anonymous
Department, University & Country	International Research Center for Agricultural Sciences, Japan