



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_8999
Title of the Manuscript:	Sugars in Whole Sesame Seed : Effects of Cultivars, Planting Dates, and Row Spacings

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
- None of the questions were answered satisfactorily. - The problem with this research is that all trails should have been planted the same year in order to see real differences between PT1 and PT2; if not the differences found between early planting dates and late planting dates could be because the effects of years. Both early planting dates were sown in 2011 and both late plantings dates were sown in 2012: "Sesame was planted on May 23 and June 8 (PT1) during 2011 and on July 17 and July 9 (PT2) during 2012...". You have to analyse the planting times with 3 degree of freedom (that is with 4 planting dates) to see if the differences were really due to PT. Chemical traits are highly influenced by environment and years. - If interactions between factors are significant, the information is very important for discussion and conclusions. - Conclusions are ambiguous and too general and that's not acceptable in a scientific article. In conclusions you have to say the best planting time, spacing and cultivar for the region.	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Elena Mazzani
Department, University & Country	Genetic Resources and Agronomy Departament, National Institute for Agricultural Research (INIA), Venezuela