



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_15969
Title of the Manuscript:	Quality Assessment of Tubewell Water for Irrigation and Impact on Soil and Crops in Central Punjab, Pakistan
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	✓ IN YOUR SOIL AND WATER ANALYSES SECTION SOILS WERE ANALYSED FOR PHs, ELECTRICAL CONDUCTIVITY OF THE SATURATED PASTE (ECE), AND WATER SAMPLES WERE ANALYSED FOR EC, CATIONS ($Ca^{2+} + Mg^{2+}, Na^+$) AND ANIONS (CO_3^{2-}, HCO_3^-) BUT YOUR R&D SECTION BASED ON TDS OF WATER HENCE IT SHOULD BE ENLISTED IN YOUR SOIL AND WATER ANALYSES SECTION. ✓ THE CRITERION FOR THE SUITABILITY OF IRRIGATION WATER AND PROCEDURES TO CALCULATE THE RSC AND SAR SHOULD BE DISCUSS IN DETAILED ✓ TOTAL DISSOLVED SALTS (TDS) OF TW RANGED FROM 218 TO 3309 MG /L IN YOUR STUDY BUT IN YOUR R & D SECTION TDS RANGED FROM 218 TO 33000 MG/L HENCE IT SHOULD BE RECTIFIED.	✓ The conversion factor of EC to TDS has been included in Soil and Water Analysis section. ✓ The information has been incorporated under section 2.3 "Soil and Water analysis" ✓ Rectified



SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Optional/General</u> comments	✓ THIS STUDY IS GOOD EFFORTS TO TOUCH TODAY HOT TOPIC. ✓ TWENTY SAMPLES, 10 FROM EACH CHICHAWATNI AND SAHIWAL TEHSILS STUDID FOR POOR WATER QUALITY EFFECT. IT SHOULD BE MORE. ✓ IN YOUR STUDY IT WAS CALCULATED THAT 96 T HA⁻¹ SOLUBLE SALTS WERE DEPOSITED IN SOIL UNDER MAIZE-POTATO-MAIZE CROPPING SEQUENCE WITH THE APPLICATION OF TW HAVING EC 5.17DSM₁ HENCE IT SHOULD BE CLEARED HOW CALCULATE THIS TO EASILY UNDERSTAND FOR A COMMON MAN. ✓ HOW ESTIMATED QUANTITY OF SOULBLE ✓ SALTS ADDED BY TUBEWELL WATER IN ✓ DIFFERENT CROPPING SYSTEM ✓ THE EFFECTS OF BRACKISH IRRIGATION WATER ON SOIL SALINITY DUE TO CONTINUOUS USE OF POOR QUALITY TW WAS EVALUATED AT FARMER'S FIELD IN TWO TEHSILS OF DISTRICT SAHIWAL DURING 2011 AND 2012 BUT STUDY NOT GIVE ANY IDEA ABOUT COVERING AREA. IT SHOULD BE CLEARED. ✓ YOU DISCUSS EFFECT OF TUBEWELL AND	✓ THAN YOU FOR COMPLIMENTS ✓ DUE TO LIMITED RESOURCES, THE STUDY WAS CONFINED TO LIMITED NUMBERS OF FARMERS. ✓ Calculation procedure has added under section 2.4. "Estimation of Soluble Salts Addition to Soil with TW Water Irrigation". Moreover, cropwise data are given in Table 3 instead of Fig.4. ✓ Calculations have added under section 2.4. "Estimation of Soluble Salts Addition to Soil with TW Water Irrigation" ✓ This information has been added in Section 2.2 "Sampling" Also corrected the study year as it was during 2012-13.
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	CANAL WATER ON CROPS YIELD OF CHICHAWATINI TEHSIL IN FIG -5 INSTEAD OF YOUR STUDY FOCUS ON BOTH TEHSIL SAHIWAL AND CHICHAWATINI.	✓ Figure showing the data of District Sahiwal has been included in Figure 5. It was present in my original submission. Anyhow it is again incorporated in the manuscript please.
--	--	--