



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                                  |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                                                                                                     |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2015_AJEA_17138                                                                                                                                                  |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Evaluation of Breeding Potential of Agro-morphological Important Traits in Forty Two Aman Rice Genotypes ( <i>Oryza sativa</i> L.) using D <sup>2</sup> analysis |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                                                                                        |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p>Line 2 (Title): Write "Evaluation of Genetic Diversity in Agromorphological Traits of Forty Two Aman Rice Genotypes (<i>Oryza sativa</i> L.) using D<sup>2</sup> Analysis"</p> <p>Line 9 (abstract): Write "Based on D<sup>2</sup> analysis" instead of "As PCA, D<sup>2</sup> and cluster analysis"</p> <p>Line 18 (key words): Write Aman rice, genetic diversity, D<sup>2</sup> analysis, PCA</p> <p>Line 19: Delete 1</p> <p>Line 40: insert and before promising hybrids</p> <p>Line 42: Delete this line completely (1.1.1 OBJECTIVE)</p> <p>Line 47: write experimental site instead of experimental site and experimental period</p> <p>Line 51: Delete line 51 and the text will be included under the section experimental site</p> <p>Line 56: write plant material instead of material</p> <p>Line 69: write field experiment instead of land preparation (this section will include land preparation, experimental design and lay out, sowing and transplanting, fertiliser application, intercultural operations and after care, plant protection measures, irrigation, harvesting and observation)</p> | <p>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> |



SDI Review Form 1.6

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p>Line 73: Delete line73 and the text will be included under the section field experiment</p> <p>Line 79: Delete line79 and the text will be included under the section field experiment</p> <p>Line 80: write 22<sup>nd</sup> July instead of 22 July, one seedling instead of 1 seedling , 24<sup>th</sup> August instead of 24 August.</p> <p>Line 83: Delete line 83 and the text will be included under the section field experiment</p> <p>Line 88: Delete line 88 and the text will be included under the section field experiment</p> <p>Line 94: Delete line 94 and the text will be included under the section field experiment</p> <p>Line 99: Delete line 99 and the text will be included under the section field experiment</p> <p>Line 103: Delete line 103 and the text will be included under the section field experiment</p> <p>Line 105: Delete line105 and the text will be included under the section field experiment</p> <p>Line 111: write PCA instead of PCO</p> <p>Line 114: write The results of D<sup>2</sup> analysis was confirmed by canonical analysis and delete “its auxillary analyses”</p> <p>*In result and discussion section the authors have to describe the results D<sup>2</sup> analysis first then principal component analysis</p> <p>Line 128: write Principal Component Analysis instead of principal Component analysis</p> <p>Line 136: Delete line 136</p> <p>Line 144: please give another three tables extra i.e.</p> | <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



SDI Review Form 1.6

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|--|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p>table 1: Name of the rice genotypes, their parentage and geographic location and table 2: Performance of forty two rice genotypes in respect of ten characters, table 3: Mean square from analysis of variance of the agro-morphological traits. Accordingly table numbering will be changed and in text it will be reflected correctly. These three tables are essential to increase the weightage of this article.</p> <p>Line 147: In fig.1 write scatter diagram of forty two rice genotypes based on their canonical roots</p> <p>Line 150: delete it</p> <p>Line 151: delete the sentence (table 4) as suggested by (14).</p> <p>Line 179: write G1, G2, G3.....G42 instead of 1,2,3.....42 in column 2 (no.of genotypes) of table2</p> <p>Line 183 to line 187: delete these lines</p> <p>Line 188: delete the sentence “between the genotypes of different clusters.</p> <p>Line 190: write (0.03) instead of (0.105)</p> <p>Line 191: write III instead of IIII</p> <p>Line 205 to 207: delete these lines</p> <p>Line 228 to 229: delete these lines</p> <p>Line 230 to 239: give proper spacing between lines</p> <p><b>If there is any ethical issue please clarify us.</b></p> | <p><b>Table 1 is included but table 2 and 3 is not possible to include here because we have already published a paper concerning the data. So it may be a duplication.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> <p><b>I have corrected it according to reviewer guidelines.</b></p> |
|--|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                        |                         |
|-----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------|
|                                         |                                                                                                                                                        |                         |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   |                                                                                                                                                        |                         |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments | Authors may follow numerical taxonomic approach for clustering and the result may be compared with $D^2$ analysis to identify more consistent clusters | It is not possible now. |