



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2015_AJEA_17341
Title of the Manuscript:	Herbicide application in precision farming based on soil organic matter
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	Abstract: what 2 herbicides? What is ED50? Line 23- types of soil characteristics? 28 – already stated in line 23-24 46: citation? 47: Do not cite a study unless you describe what they did and what they found. How is it relevant to your work? This happens frequently throughout intro 48: define ED50 before using 59: more or less? 79-83: Place aim of study before hypothesis. 104: how was the soil collected, where was the soil collected from? When? 108: why this multiplication? Is it a standard? Cite if so 111: greenhouse conditions? Move line 122-126 after this sentence It should be more clearly stated how the varying OM at the different sites affected the herbicide efficacy and how the different rates varied. F and P values are missing from Fig 2	Accepted, Added Accepted, added In parts, adsorption is described. No changes. Noted. Is documented by the other citations. It is a results from literature. General information added. Accepted, added Accepted, deleted Accepted Accepted, added. Standard, added. Accepted, added. No changes Accepted, added
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	Line 14-15: reword 20: describe what spatial soil is 26: more or less? 35: did you mean sorption? Check throughout 36: should not start sentence with preposition 91-97: sentence form 112: are the Bayer codes necessary? Not used in text anywhere else 113: transplanted instead of pricked out	Unclear, no changes Accepted, revised Yes Sorption (adsorption/desorption) Accepted, no changes Accepted, revised Accepted, revised Accepted, deleted Accepted, revised



SDI Review Form 1.6

	116: is this sentence necessary? 117: what is BBCH 11-12? 157: reword so figure it cited and not started at beginning of sentence 175: what is considered to be good weed control? Fig3: unclear on legend – where is site 73? Fig 4: missing site 70 – dose response curve for other herbicide? Y axis unclear Needs a lot more description and clarification. I would not be able to repeat this experiment. Statistics are missing. Unclear how soil OM and herbicides interacted and what the overall take home message is. Good idea, can easily be used in broad scale weed control, just needs more detail.	Not necessary, deleted It is a growth stage code (1 to 2 leaves). BBCH deleted. Accepted, revised. >90, as mentioned in the text. Results of site 73 were not included (only example) Results of site 70 were not included (only example). Y axis efficacy – freshmatter plants; revised Noted. Results show clearly the interaction between OM and the tested soil active herbicides. For use in agricultural practise field experiments are needed.
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	Spacing issues Indent paragraphs Authors repeat content in introduction often Use more descriptive labels than Experiment 1 and 2 – Are they really different experiments, or is just the same exp for the different herbicides? Tables and Figures should be able to stand alone – legends need to be more clear, axes should be capitalized	Noted Noted, but necessary for understanding Noted. It is not considered necessary. Noted. Experiment 1 and 2 are bioassays with different soils and herbicides. Noted. Additions wherever necessary.