



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2015_AJEA_16761
Title of the Manuscript:	Grain health protectant activity of essential oils against infestation and damage of haricot bean by <i>Zabrotes subfasciatus</i> (Boheman)
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	The work is interesting and original; it touches on a vital sector for food security especially in less developed countries. The manuscript is clear. However there are some minor comments to fulfil as mentioned below.	Thank you
Minor REVISION comments	Abstract Line 9: use active ingredient name instead of commercial one of the insecticide used; Introduction Line 32: replace Bruchidae by Chrysomelidae; add Misangu after and; line 34: add Misangu after and; Lines 47 et 53: (Shaaya <i>et al.</i>, 1997) miss in the reference list; Materials and Methods Line 65: replace 1lt by 1 L; Line 90: replace gm by g; Line 92 add s to grain; Line 99: add s to hour; Line 115: In actual fact, the losses are underestimated insofar as the frass were not considered; Line 119: the grains were exposed to 40°C before use, is that there is an effect on seed germination? Results Lines 138, 139, 141, 142 and 144: add s to hour Line 139: Cf. line 295: table 2 add SE after Mean;	Accepted and the active ingredient name is primiphos-methyl Accepted No need of mentioning the author of the species more than one in the body of the paper Line 47 et and 53 mitted Line 65 accepted Line 90 accepted Line 92 accepted Line 99 accepted But, it is true for all treatments Germination test proved that it had no effect on germination Accepted and included in the text Accepted and included in the text Accepted and included in the text



SDI Review Form 1.6

	Discussion Lines 176, 180 and 184: add s to hour; Line 197: add s to grain; References: The reference list will be improved to update; Add pages to certain references (e.g. lines 251, 257, etc. cf. list); Lines 244 and 272: suppress ou of throuee; Line 247: Sinensis with small letter; Line 265: suppress s bruchids; Line 283: “Shaaya, E. and Kostyukovsky, M. (2006). Essential oils: potency against stored product insects and mode of action. <i>Stew. Post harv. Rev.</i> 4: 1-6.” are not cited in the text; Tables Line 292: add plant species filiation in table 1; Line 295: add SE after Mean in table 2.	Accepted and included in the text Accepted and included in the text Accepted and included in the text Accepted and included in the text Accepted and included in the text Accepted and included in the text Accepted and included in the text Accepted and included in the text
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	To disinfect grains, It will better to expose grains to negative temperature (-18°C);	I will consider the comments for future work and thank you for the information