



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2015_AJEA_18482
Title of the Manuscript:	Genotype x Environment and Stability Analysis of Oil Content in Sesame (<i>Sesamum indicum</i> L.) Evaluated across Diverse Agro-ecologies of the Awash Valleys in Ethiopia
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	The manuscript represents a valuable study on the effect of genotype x environment interactions on stability of oil content in selected sesame varieties grown in different habitats of Afar valley in Ethiopia. The manuscript is very well written, it provides sophisticated statistical analysis of the presented data, and clear conclusions are driven. I can therefore recommend the manuscript for publication. I have only minor comments on the manuscript: 1/ In the manuscript title, there should be written "Genotype x Environment interaction", i.e., "Genotype x Environment interaction and stability analysis of oil content in sesame (Sesamum indicum L.) evaluated across diverse agro-ecologies of the awash valleys in Ethiopia" 2/ I understand that the input parameter was oil content in sesame seeds for the individual genotypes and environments (locations and seasons). In Table 2, a parameter "Mean yield/ha" is given. Does it mean the seed oil content or something other? This should be specified by the authors. Moreover, any reference on extraction procedure of sesame oil extraction should be given. 3/ References: According to the reference list, the reference on line 59 should be cited as "John et al.	I thank you so much for your valuable comments. All your comments are well taken. Right, it was done by mistake. Because the same material was used for yield analysis, which was directly copied. All the typographic corrections are acknowledged. Nobody observed at them so far. Appreciated!



SDI Review Form 1.6

	2001" (not "John and Jebbaraj 2001" since there are more than two authors), the reference on line 67 should be cited as "Akcura et al. 2005" (not "Akcura and Taner 2005" since there are more than two authors) and the reference on line 215 should be cited as "Abou El-Nasr et al. 2002" (not "El-Nasr et al. 2002") according to the reference list. Minor comments: Abstract, line 13: Correct the spelling in the word "thrice" (not "trice") Line 20: Insert a comma after the word "Finally,..." Lines 63, 64: Correct the spelling in the word "univariate" (not "univariate") Line 347: Write "one" instead of "unity" in the sentence "regression coefficient (b) around one" Line 365: Correct the spelling in the word "slope" (not "slop") Line 394: Use a singular form of the verb "exhibits" in the sentence "a variety that exhibits a high mean..." Lines 402, 405, 407: Insert a comma before (and after) the word "respectively" Line 404: Write "medium-yielding varieties" Line 406: Write "the remaining varieties" Conclusion, line 422: Correct the sentence as follows: "Moreover, the study indicated a high performance..." Line 423: I do not understand the meaning of "the off season" - the re should probably be written "the second season"	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		