



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_19553
Title of the Manuscript:	Use of Vigor Tests in Cucurbit Rootstock Cultivars
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	In general, the manuscript focused on effect accelerated ageing (AA), controlled deterioration (CD), cold tests (CT), electrical conductivity (EC) and mean germination (MGT) tests for the discriminating vigor of cucurbit rootstock seeds. Kindly refer to the following suggested corrections: Abstract: The problem statement associated with the effects of different parameters on the discriminating vigor of cucurbit rootstock seeds should be highlighted at the initial part of abstract The research objectives of paper should be re-write clearly. The finding on the effect of accelerated ageing, controlled deterioration, cold test, electrical conductivity and mean germination for different cucurbit rootstock cultivar seeds should be comparatively analysed and discussed. Introduction: Literature background on the effect of accelerated ageing, controlled deterioration, cold test, electrical conductivity and mean germination on grafting for different plants should be provided. It is better for the author to come out with one comparative table to list down all the difference. Literature should be provided for the vigor test, the	The first 5-6 lines were added to discriminate the importance of vigour in cucurbit rootstock seeds. We are not aware of any vigour test conducted on rootstock seeds in cucurbits. There are number of studies in different cucurbit species including watermelon, melon, cucumber etc. However, rootstock seeds are rather hybrids. So the genetic background is different. Plus obtaining the number of different seed lots which is the main approach in vigor studies, are not easy since they are very expensive seeds.



SDI Review Form 1.6

	funding and general effect for the grafting of plant Results and discussion Details discussion supported with the latest and current references should be provided for: (i) Normal seedling percentages of cucurbit rootstock seed cultivars after accelerated ageing and controlled deterioration, CD test (ii) Normal seedling percentages of cucurbit rootstock seed cultivars after cold test 4 days at 10 oC then 10 days at 25 oC (iii) Changes in MGT (h) and EC values ($\mu\text{mS cm}^{-1}\text{g}^{-1}$) of 13 cucurbit rootstock cultivar seeds.	We are not aware of any vigour tests in rootstock seed lots in any cucurbit species. Therefore we just refer to those lots that belong to the species not rootstocks.
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		