



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEA_20510
Title of the Manuscript:	Effects Of Incision Variation Length On Heterobranchus bidorsalis Male Spawners To Extract Milt For Induced Breeding.
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The objective of the study which was 'to find alternative to sacrificing males so that they can be used for repeated production' as stated in lines 54 – 59 has not been properly addressed in this work. - How many individuals were in each of the replicate of each treatment? - How many survived in each of T1, T2, T3 - If a particular set up has better genetic vigour than the others, then the bias should have removed or accounted for to pave way for logical and unbiased conclusion - The centre of the work is the number of male brooders that survived in each treatment and were able to recuperate and 'could be reused a second time'. - There are ethical issues to be addressed too 24 brooders were purchased, 12 males, 12 females 6 (males) were sacrificed - There were 4 treatments, each replicated thrice this is equivalent to one animal per treatment. - If 6 (males) were already sacrificed (line 77) out of the 12 males, the questions are (a) <i>how many animals were used?</i> (b) <i>where did they get the animals used for the four treatments and the three replicates?</i> (b) <i>How many animals per replicate?</i> Line 50 'male African catfish' The authors should try and explain some of the matters raised eg why did he sacrificed six of them? There should be an explanation. Thank you	
I have no vested interest in this work. Your journal will be assessed by he quality of papers you published. It is also important to guide the upcoming ones in the field. I advice with all sense of responsibility that the authors should either include other information relevant to this work if he has them somewhere or do a rerun.	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Ipinmoroti, Mabel O
Department, University & Country	Osun State University, Osogbo, Nigeria