



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_9994
Title of the Manuscript:	GGE Biplot Analysis of Multi-Environment Yield Trials of durum wheat (<i>Triticum turgidum</i> Desf.) genotypes in North Western Ethiopia.
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	Mega environment delineation: repeatable 'which-won-where' pattern is very mandatory and hence with these limited year and genotype data, it might be misleading to recommend different mega environments and thus could be unachievable objective. Hence it needs adjustment right from the objective to discussion. Polygon view of GGE: Hence you produced your GGE biplot from Genestat, it lacks clarity and visibility. Consequently, your discussion from the polygon is not correct, like discrepancies on the vertex genotypes and winners in different environment sectors. Title: Since your GGE biplots are not from full GGE software, it lacks completeness and hence better to modify at least moving GGE to the end rather than at the beginning. Abstract: it is too much and should be reduced by focusing only on major findings rather than writing everything - Poor and very weak justifications are mentioned to undertake the experiment and also unsatisfactory justifications using GGE to analyse the multi-environment wheat grain yield data Discriminating and representative power of GGE: You can produce a biplot that will show u both; rather than producing two biplots and in which one of them is very incomplete in your case. In GGE, once u defined your 'environment' as	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	combination of locations and years, you need to be consistence and focused on the environment rather than the components and hence you need to show and present their values (df, SS, MS and its significance) in your ANOVA structure before partitioning them. 8. Mean performance and stability data are mandatory and should be presented. How they are good performed and stable? 9. Conclusion: it is very week and not comprehensive and should be rewritten. 10. Please concentrate on published references and also include recent references published in line with the subject.	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	a) Some language and editorial revisions are necessary b) It is the full responsibility of the authors to check the inclusion of reference both in the body and list of references.	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	Mean performance and stability analysis undertaken well except the data not presented as commented above	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Anonymous
Department, University & Country	Ethiopia