



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                       |
|--------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                                                          |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2015_AJEA_17727                                                                                                       |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Use of Selected Herbicides and Application Methods for Tolerance to Tifton 85 Bermudagrass [Cynodondactylon(L.)Pers.] |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                                             |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p>Correct lack of space between words in the title.<br/><b>[Cynodon dactylon (L.) Pers.]</b></p> <p>To improve readability of the <b>Abstract</b>, the names of the herbicides used should not be written in <b>Aims</b> but must appear on <b>Methodology</b>. Also on Methodology must state the variables measured and recorded.</p> <p><b>Keywords.</b> OK. But, fix spelling errors (space between words): <b>bermudagrass yield</b>. I suggest adding in key words: herbicides.</p> <p><b>Introduction.</b> OK. But, fix spelling errors (space between words): Line 34 (<b>Cynodon dactylon (L.) Pers.</b>), Line 43 (Coastal x common), Koger et al. [8]found; Line 51 ([14]evaluated); Line 52 (0.2kg ai ha<sup>-1</sup>plus 0.2kg ai ha<sup>-1</sup> and <b>triclopyr plus fluroxypyr</b>); Line 58 (<b>picloram plus fluroxypyr was</b>); Line 85 (<b>assess phytotoxic</b>).</p> <p><b>Materials and Methods.</b> Ok. Correct. Missing space between words. <b>2.2Herbicides</b> and doses.</p> <p><b>Results. OK.</b> Paragraphs written in Results should be present in Discussion.<br/>Analyze this paragraph and include in Discussion.<br/>Correct spelling errors:</p> |                                                                                                                                                                               |



SDI Review Form 1.6

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|  | <p>“The lack of necrosis seen in 2006 may be due to the later rating date in 2006 compared with 2007 as well as a lack of rainfall during the month of application as well as the month following application (Table 1). <b>Postemergence</b> herbicide efficacy may be affected by environmental factors including air temperature, relative humidity, and dew or precipitation [21,22,23]. These environmental conditions may influence processes such as herbicide absorption, translocation, or plant metabolism, which influence herbicide efficacy [24]. Conditions at time of herbicide application (Table 2) were much more favorable for translocation of the herbicide within the plant in 2007 than 2006. Triclopyr has been reported to significantly injure both common and ‘hybrid’ bermudagrass [<b>Cynodondacylon (L.)Pers. X C. transvaalensisBurt-Davy</b>] when applied at twice the labeled rate [25]. Multiple applications of triclopyr at 0.5 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> 182 or triclopyr plus clopyralid at 0.5 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> plus 0.6 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> has been reported to injure bermudagrass up to 30% [26].”</p> <p>“All triclopyr containing treatments with the exception of <b>triclopyrplussulfuron</b> methyl resulted in a greater growth reduction (19 to 24%) than treatments which contained picloram (&lt; 11%). In contrast, Butler and Evers [27] reported no reduction in bermudagrass growth when triclopyr plus fluroxypyr, picloram plus fluroxypyr, or triclopyr plus clopyralid was applied to newly sprigged “Coastal” and “Tifton 85” bermudagrass and they concluded that these herbicides could be safely used on newly established bermudagrass sprigs.”</p> |  |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
|----------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|                                  | <p><b>Discussion.</b> Expand the contents of the Discussion. Compare the measured variables with other published scientific papers (necrosis?, Crude protein content?).</p> <p><b>Conclusion.</b> The first written paragraph in the Conclusion could be present in the Discussion. Analyse the content of this paragraph.</p> |  |
| <b>Minor</b> REVISION comments   | Correct spelling errors in the Bibliography. E.g. Line 331: [31]AdkinsSW, Tanpipat S, Swarbrick JT, Boersma M. Influence of environmental factors....                                                                                                                                                                          |  |
| <b>Optional/General</b> comments | <i>This paper reports many interesting observations. Some corrections should be done on the content and form before its publication.</i>                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                             |                                                 |
|---------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Name:</b>                                | Lucas Ricardo                                   |
| <b>Department, University &amp; Country</b> | National University of Mar del Plata, Argentina |