



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2014_AJEA_9994
Title of the Manuscript:	GGE Biplot Analysis of Multi-Environment Yield Trials of durum wheat (<i>Triticum turgidum</i> Desf.) genotypes in North Western Ethiopia.
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	1. The biplots presented in this article has to be clarified: 1) The biplots have no scales on the axes so it is not possible to know whether they are drawn to scale or not, which is a key for valid interpretation. 2) The model that is used to generate the GGE biplot is not indicated, which makes it difficult to judge the validity of the interpretations. 2. The biplot in figure 1 only display sectors, which are not necessarily mega-environments. Mega-environments are geographic regions. For example, sectors 2 and 3 have the same location Gaint. Gaint may be regarded as a different ME from the other locations. 3. Once it is determined that the target environments should be divided into ME, than genotype and test location evaluation should be conducted within ME rather than across ME. This has to be reflected in the analysis. 4. The statement that ideal genotypes should have the greatest PC1 scores is always true. The correct statement should be: a genotype with the greatest projection on the average environment axis. 5. Regarding the interpretation of Figure 3: NOTE: this definition of an ideal genotype is to assign mean and instability the same weight, which may not be	



SDI Review Form 1.6

	always appropriate. See Yan (2014): "Crop Variety Trials: Data Management and Analysis, Wiley & Sons. 6. The interpretation of discriminating power regarding Figure 4: the statement is true only for unscaled GGE biplot. What is the model that you have used to generate the biplots?	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	See attached file. There are many broken words in the manuscript: "bi plot", "where as", etc. There are some grammar problems as well.	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	Many of the methods and statements were copied from Yan's work. However, this is OK as soon as the original work is properly cited	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	<i>Weikai Yan</i>
Department, University & Country	<i>Eastern Cereal and Oilseed Research Centre, Ontario, Canada</i>