



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012 BJASt 2667
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of aerobic exercise on postmenopausal women with major depression

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

- This form has total 9 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	This is an interesting small study, although arises some concern. First of all, was the purpose to evaluate treatment of depression related to menopause, or were the participants menopausal women with depression? If the first one, then how did you evaluate the menopausal symptoms? Was there any difference in symptoms, e.g. in hot flushes, insomnia, lack of appetite etc, or months since menopause? Second, in statistical analyses you should compare the groups with each other, not the change inside the groups. Baseline depression values must be used as a covariate. Both groups seemed to have change in depression scale, but group B had an increase from 18.66 to 19.66, at least by Table 2. Please, explain.	Yes ,I agree with most corrections This stuy concentrate on major depression sa a complication of postmenopause Evaluation of depression according to Hamilton depression scale contain several items as lack of appetite....etc We compaire between the subjects in the same group and between subjects in onther group to detect the effect of aerobic ex. In goup A then compair with group B. Subects selected randomly in both groups without fitness tests, most of participants are housewives(no sport). <i>Many thanks</i>
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	Did you do power calculations before the study? The groups are very small. It would also be interesting to know, if there were any other changes in women's menopausal symptoms due to treatments, e.g. fewer hot flashes per day, or better quality of sleep. How about physical fitness? Did you have any fitness tests?	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		

Special note: The patients had signed the informed consent form, but there is no mention about approval of Ethics Committee.