



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2013_BJAST_3159
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of Aerobic Exercise on Depression and Insomnia in post Menopausal Women

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

[\[http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline\]](http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline)

- This form has total 9 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	Many parts of the manuscript require grammatical correction. I suggest the reviewer recruit a colleague proficient in English to review and edit the manuscript. The manuscript is very long and wordy. Much of the introduction and discussion sections can be shortened by focusing on the main aspect of the study. A major limitation of the study is lack of a non-exercise control group. The depressive and insomnia symptoms may have improved only because the women were receiving increased attention throughout the study. The manuscript is not very original. The authors need to highlight the novelty of this study compared to other studies in postmenopausal women that have assessed the effect of exercise training on depression or insomnia. What does your study add to the literature in this area? Examples of recent studies that have evaluated effects of exercise training on depression or insomnia in postmenopausal women include: Gutierrez et al. J. Clin. Nurs. 2012 Moilanen et al. Menopause 2012 Kemmler et al. Med. Sci. Sports Exerc. 2005	The correction was done. Thanks for your valuable notes, The correction was done. The group is controlling itself as we assessed the group before and after the treatment program, with the mentioned delimitations. This is a new application for already existing study. In Egypt, females have a different life style with much lower level of physical activity which makes them interesting test subjects for this proved case.
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	How was menopausal status in the women determined?	The female is at least 5 years after menopause,



SDI Review Form 1.6

	You need to provide references for the questionnaires you used to evaluate depression and insomnia. It is not clear how scores are derived from the depression questionnaire with the formula provides on line 120. You need to include a section describing your statistical analyses before the results section. Please indicate whether results are presented as means (SD). Lines 129-134: What is meant by “no resistance” when describing the treadmill exercise? In the same section it is stated that maximal heart rate was detected by the Borg scale. This scale is either a scale from 1-10 or from 1-20 that allows someone to rate their perceived exertion during exercise. It is unclear how you measured heart rate from this.	diagnosed by physician. The correction was done. I clarify the table by adding the numbers of the chosen answer which vary between 1 and 4. Raw data obtained by adding these numbers which ranged from 20 to 80 then multiplied by 100 then divided by 80 which represent the maximum score. The correction was done. The machine was set on zero resistance and inclination was zero also. HR max is the maximum predicted heart rate, ex. HR max = 220 – age (years). Borg's RPE scale : <table><tr><td>6</td><td>No exertion at all</td></tr><tr><td>7</td><td>Extremely light</td></tr><tr><td>8</td><td></td></tr><tr><td>9</td><td>Very light</td></tr><tr><td>10</td><td></td></tr><tr><td>11</td><td>Light</td></tr></table>	6	No exertion at all	7	Extremely light	8		9	Very light	10		11	Light
6	No exertion at all													
7	Extremely light													
8														
9	Very light													
10														
11	Light													



SDI Review Form 1.6

		12 13 Somewhat hard 14 15 Hard 16 17 Very hard 18 19 Extremely hard 20 Maximal exertion The RPE scale, i.e, the 15-grade scale for ratings (R) of perceived (P) exertion (E). I delete it
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	The tables are redundant with the figures (i.e. they present the same information). I suggest deleting figures 3 , 4, and 5. There is no statement about whether the study was approved by an ethics review board or ethics committee. This should be included.	The approval was added.