



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2013_BJAST_3159
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of Aerobic Exercise on Depression and Insomnia in post Menopausal Women

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

[\[http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline\]](http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline)

- This form has total 9 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	This is an interesting topic and increasingly so but unfortunately as it stands at the moment, this is not a well conceptualized paper. My primary reason for recommending that this paper be rejected is because that the results of such studies can not be attributed exclusively to aerobic exercise. To confirm this effect of exercise on depression and insomnia should have a control group without exercise. Moreover the results do not refer to effectiveness of the aerobic training because no variable related to it was assessed.	The group is controlling itself as we assessed the group before and after the treatment program, with the mentioned delimitations that creates the same environment for all patients.
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	The introduction is too long and unspecific. The authors need to be more succinct and improve the logic of the text since the goal of the study is not clear at this session. Why investigate the effects of exercise since the American College of Sports Medicine recommends aerobic exercise and weights for the population in question?	Thanks for your comments, the introduction was reduced -We apply this study in Egypt. -This is a new application for already existing study. In Egypt, females have a different life style with much lower level of physical activity which makes them interesting test subjects for this prove case.
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	The aerobic exercise prescription needs further detail and reasoning. The exercise intensity used promotes improvements in cardiovascular system? The ACSM recommends low intensity aerobic exercises five times a week. In this study was used	-The statistical analysis was applied. -The effect aerobic exercise in cardiovascular



SDI Review Form 1.6

	only 3 times, which according to the recommendation should be high intensity exercise to promote improvement in cardiovascular system. Several important information was not shown in the study as statistical analysis, results of cardiorespiratory fitness, medical examination. The session results is not appropriate because the values expressed in the tables are repeated in graphs.	system is out of our scope as we assess depression and insomnia only, and this should be applied in further researches. -The figures were deleted
--	---	---