



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	2012 BJAST 2541
Title of the Manuscript:	QUALITY AND SHELF – LIFE ASSESSEMENT OF VARIOUSLY PROCESSED CATFISH AND TILAPIA STORED AT AMBIENT TEMPERATURE

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
MS is not acceptable for publication. A major revision is needed. (see enclosed comments for details) L21-25: This is not related to the topic of the study (the function of metals in fish metabolism and how deficiency may affect fish health). Instead, state why you decided to study metals here, related to water pollution and human health? If so, write about why you choose to study Fe, Zn, Cd and Pb. What are the concerns of eating polluted fish...? ☐ L33 – etc: After defining species (latin) in the M&M section, use common names (carp and tilapia) ☐ Sample = 50 g of fish piece? Do you mean a piece of fillet (white muscle only?) ☐ The number used of each fish species must be stated! The number of fish and fish samples are probably not identical? Explain! ☐ State capture method ☐ Move sentence 'All chemicals and reagents..' to the end of section 2.3.3 2.2 Fish processing ☐ Moisture content 15 +/- 5 %. Describe how it was measured (method). ☐ Give number of samples (n) for the various treatments ☐ Last sentence in section 2.2: you used fresh fish as baseline data for comparison. Where are these data shown?	The sentence indicates that many of such elements (e.g Fe) take part in human metabolic processes (not fish) and are known to be indispensable to all living things. Both Fe and Zn are required by the body in minute amounts. If processing reduces their concentration in fish, consumer nutrition may be deficient. Cd and Pb are both toxic metals which may be introduced during processing. Done Whole fish were cut into pieces of approximately 50g prior to processing Two species of fish were used for the study: <i>Chrysichthys nigrodigitatus</i> and <i>Tilapia zillii</i>. 20 of each species were collected for the study: 5 for each processing method (OVD, BOVD, SMKD, raw) Fish were captured by artisans using gill nets ok Moisture content of fish was determined as weight loss of 5g of fresh fish after drying to constant weight. 5 for each treatment per specie Table 1



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

2.3.2 TVC ☐ How did you excise the sample from the fish? With or without skin?	Without skin
2.3.2 TVN ☐ Sulphuric and selenium tablets? Describe!	Selenium tablet is a catalyst used during sample digestion and it contains 1.5 g K2SO4 and 7.5 mg Se
☐ Last sentence in section: 'Both reagents were prepared...' State why this is important.	
2.3.4 Trace metals ☐ AAS: state (Model, Manufacturer, Address)	Buck 205 AA by Buck Scientific. Number 58 Fort Point Street East Norwalk, CT 06855
Add section (2.3.5) Statistics. You did 3 trials with n = ? fish or n = ? samples...? Significant: $p < 0.05$; Not significant: $p > 0.05$ (throughout)	ok