



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012/BJAST/2826
Title of the Manuscript:	Cherenkov Effect in ionospheric E layer plasma for Oxygen-ion.

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Unfortunately, authors have not taken into account the most part of my criticisms. I would like to repeat the main of them. - The section "Introduction" consists well known results from the theory of Cherenkov radiation. This is misplaced for original paper. - In my opinion, the theoretical part of the section 2 is not original as well. Moreover, this part does not contain any references. This theory is considered in well known books (see, for example, [V. L. Ginzburg, The propagation of electromagnetic waves in plasmas]). If authors' results coincide with known ones, the analysis should be replaced with correspond references. If authors' results differ from known ones, the comparison should be done. - The manuscript include a lot of substitutions of numerical values in formulae. It is enough to show the final results only. - The figures do not look well. Many symbols and numbers in figures are not distinct. I cannot recommend to publish this manuscript. However, authors could present an essentially shorter work taking into account the criticisms mentioned here and in the previous review.	1- With special thanks to reviewer 2- All your comments are o.k 3- But as you see you could find everything that you mentioned in your comments you will find in the paper but you should be awarded that this kind of writing manner is my opinion so if i wish to change all refer to your idea then this paper would be changed completely into a new paper . for example if some parts misplaced you will find this in other parts , refer to my idea the most important thing that I wished to find was that if theoretically Cherenkov effects is possible in the E layer Plasma how it would be happened ? for this also i prepared an evidence that mentioned at the last part of the paper ,(Part 4 paper & reference 12) 4- . truly yours Dr Zahra Emami Prof of plasma physics school of Science Islamic Azad University Iran (Z.Emami corresponding author) Mashhad