



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	2012_BJAST_2872
Title of the Manuscript:	Assessing the Efficiency of Ateel Wastewater Treatment Station for Rehabilitation Improving the Water Quality and its Safe and Practical Application

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Authors did not take the previous comments into consideration too much! Introduction, 2nd paragraph: the information on water volume is repeated in the section 2.2. Authors HAVE TO DELETE it from one section!!!!!!!!!!!!!! Figure 1 shows rather two people than wastewater treatment plant. Delete it or replace it with a picture of the wastewater treatment plant without people. Section results and discussion, 2nd paragraph: Authors should add reference(s) to the information about the organic content. The sources should be reliable. Section 3, 5th paragraph, bottom of 3rd page: Were the "significant" variations tested statistically? If not, authors should not use the term "significant" which usually refers to statistical analysis. Table 3: Authors should also include an average values in this Table. Figure 6: Authors should not use the term "biological" parameters in the legend because TDS (total dissolved solids) and COD (chemical oxygen demand) are not biological parameters and E.coli is microbiological parameter. All the legends are too simple, they should be more descriptive, for example "Average concentration of TDS, BOD5, COD and average numbers of E.coli in the inflow and outflow at Ateel wastewater treatment plant. Figure 5- E. coli is probably not in ppm! Figure 6: add units to the "y" axis Page 7: in the text describing nitrification and denitrification there should be arrows between various forms so it should be clear that one form is created from the previous one Figure 10: not necessary, it is not related to the results. General comment: authors should include limits for irrigation water	Thanks: I agree. It is deleted now Thanks: I agree. It is deleted also Thanks: This is a well-known concept. You can find it in any "Biochemistry TextBook". Look under "cellular respiration". Please check this link if you are unable to get a book. http://highered.mcgraw-hill.com/sites/dl/free/0073525502/930160/mad25502_ch08.pdf Thanks: revised Do you mean Table 2. Because there is no Table 3 Thanks: I agree, and I revised it I agree it is in cfu. I put a star to indicate that. Please note I re-numbered the figures because I deleted one and I fixed the y axis Changed Deleted

Note: Modification was done in this document ONLY to hide some comments, which are against the SDI peer review guidelines.