



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2013_BJAST_3159
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of Aerobic Exercise on Depression and Insomnia in post Menopausal Women

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
My reasons are based mainly because authors can not assign the effect of aerobic exercise for improving depression and insomnia. To do this purpose they must have a control group without exercise was to show that the isolated effect of exercise that promoted this improvement on depression and insomnia. In the current situation whatever reason may have influenced this improvement as exercise, the social environment, finance, etc.. Additionally the authors did not have information on the effectiveness of the proposed exercise and so takes all the merits of the study, since any exercise, systematized or could not have pursued the same influences. Even the absence of this group without exercise makes statistical analysis more sensitive to small changes, which occurred in this study. The introduction of arguments lead us to the choice of exercise was based on the popularity of it, and not the benefits it can promote to the population in question. In this session the authors argue regular exercise, physical activity, but not aerobic exercise? And why not use the concurrent training that is most appropriate for this population? Completing the study can not prove that exercise was effective and that improvement in depression and sleep are linked to performance, and that there is no plausible justification for the choice of the same.	The group is controlling itself as we assess the group before and after the treatment program, with the following delimitations, They all the same socioeconomic standard they had no history of renal, liver or endocrinal disorders, cardiac affection or history of smoking, that creates the same environment for all patients, that's why the reduction of the depression and insomnia were due to the treatment programme. This is a new application for already existing study. In Egypt, females have a different life style with much lower level of physical activity which makes them interesting test subjects for this proved case. Hence, the effect of exercise changes with the change of the physical activity level of the subjects. So, using concurrent training was based on previous studies on subjects of different physical activity levels.