



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2013_BJAST_3159
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of Aerobic Exercise on Depression and Insomnia in post Menopausal Women

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The authors have responded to most of my comment; however, they have not incorporated many of the changes into the manuscript. One of my major comments was lack of a control group. The authors responded that the participants acted as their own controls because they were tested before and after an intervention. As I mentioned in my previous comments, the depressive symptoms may have improved because the women were receiving more attention, rather the changes elicited by the physical activity program. I suggest you simply add a statement in your discussion section that lack of control group was a limitation of the study. The authors responded that it is original because Egyptian women have different lifestyles and therefore a study in Egyptian women is original. I agree with the authors' response, but I think you need to indicate this in the introduction of your manuscript to outline the original aspect of your study. I also suggested you add some references to similar studies in the literature: Gutierrez et al. J. Clin. Nurs. 2012 Moilanen et al. Menopause 2012 Kemmler et al. Med. Sci. Sports Exerc. 2005 I think the manuscript would be improved if you added these references and mention these studies in the introduction or discussion section. I am still confused by the scoring system used for the depression questionnaire. Some of the questions are positive aspects (for example "I feel that I am useful and needed") and some are negative aspects (for example, "I feel that other people would be better off if I was dead."). These appear to be scored the same way according to the formula. Please provide clarification. Statistical analyses: Please indicate the type of t-test that was used. It should be a dependant samples t-test. Ethic approval: Please provide the name of the specific ethics committee that approved the study.	Thanks for your valuable comments The correction was done in line (155) I add it in the <u>Aim of the study</u>. The references were added, and highlighted In some questionnaires, there should be contradicted questions to confirm the patient responds. The correction was done in line 110 The study was approved by ethical committee of Faculty of Physical Therapy, Cairo University; this correction was done in the manuscript.