



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

Part 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012 BJASt 2667
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of aerobic exercise on postmenopausal women with major depression

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
Thank you for the revised manuscript. Unfortunately I did not find changes compared with the previous manuscript. Since all women had menopausal symptoms by Hamilton scale, the authors could do a table with baseline characteristics and show how the menopausal symptoms (e.g. in hot flushes, insomnia, time since menopause etc.) were spread in each group. I still think that the comparison between the groups should be the main purpose and study question number one in this study. Both groups had medication, and due to this treatment it was expected to see some recovery inside both groups. Although the mean difference in depression points was not statistically significant at baseline, it must be used as a covariate. The lack of statistical significance may be due to very small study groups. The authors have not answered to my question about power calculations before the study. And in what symptoms the participants had most relief?	Postmenopausal women were already diagnosed by the physician, then the severity of depression is measured by hamilton scale(which used to measure the severity of depression, not menopausal symptoms), menopausal symptoms as hot flushes, insomnia are part of this scale for example: sweating, tremor, headache, stomach cramp ...etc are present under one item of this scale (anxiety somatic) these symptoms are present collectively and give one score, time since menopause at least 12 months ago (methodology)(line 72,73) Both groups had medication at the start of the study (before the study, they were not treated by any medication). So, there was some recovery inside both groups but when we compare between the groups we found that (aerobic+medication)group(A) improved than (medication)group(B) where (P=.002) which is considered as the main question in study(line 109-112) our limitation in this study was small study group, because in our community there is lack of participants due to the social and cultural level of these women. Power calculations before the study based on some recommendations for several authors in different articles (no pilot study). Our study concerned with the intensity of depression which measured by hamilton scale, not concerned with postmenopausal symptoms Thanks