

-----Original Message-----

From: XXX YYY<xxx@yyy.zzz>

Sent: Thu, Aug 15, 2013 at 8:46 PM

To: Managing Editor

Subject: Re: Request for final decision for manuscript number 2013/BJAST/5799

I've been reading carefully the files regarding the manuscript 'Magnetic Fluid Lubrication of Finite Journal Bearing; 3-D Analysis Using FDM'. Since the reviewers made opposite final evaluations my decision was not easy to make.

The authors succeeded in answering to reviewer#1's comments. Nevertheless, they did not obtain the approval of reviewer#2. The reviewer considers that two questions remain unsolved: 1- How the algebraic equations obtained by Finite Difference Method were solved? 2- Which boundary conditions were applied?. The answer of the authors was that solution was achieved by making a MATLAB program based on Sommerfeld boundary conditions. Nevertheless, Sommerfeld boundary conditions only apply in the case of infinitely long bearing assumption, which is not the case of this paper. The explanation missed is that in the reference (1. Fedor J.V. A Sommerfeld solution for finite bearings with circumferential grooves. Journal of basic engineering.1960;82(2):321-326), which was not in the original manuscript but included in the revised one. Therefore I think the reviewer's question was mostly solved.

In my opinion, the authors had answered most of the inquiries of the reviewers and the work is valuable. Therefore I recommend it for publication.

Editor's Details:

Elena Lanchares Sancho

Area Continuum Mechanics

and Theory of Structures

Department of Mechanical Engineering

Ebro River Campus, Bldg Betancourt, University of Zaragoza, Spain

Note: Modification was done in this document ONLY to hide the email id.